

# **Sinking strangers**

**Media representations of climate refugees on the BBC and Al Jazeera**

**Elida Høeg**



Supervisor: Dr. Christopher Tulloch

Master in International Studies on Media, Power and Difference, 2016/2017  
Research projects of the Department of Communication postgraduate programmes

Department of Communication  
Universitat Pompeu Fabra

**Abstract:** This study seeks to investigate the media representations of climate refugees in two global media outlets: The BBC and Al Jazeera. An exhaustive sample of the online coverage from 2000 until 2017 has been gathered and examined through a content analysis guided by framing theory and multimodal critical discourse analysis. After reviewing the 29 news stories, this paper finds that climate refugees are framed in four ways: As *victims*, *security threats*, *activists* and *abstractions*. In both media outlets, climate refugees are aggregated, collectivized and made generic – and their situation is deagentialized. The study concludes that the BBC mainly talks *about* climate refugees instead of talking *to* them, and that this has an impact on the climate refugees’ depicted agency. Al Jazeera quotes more climate refugees in their journalistic coverage, and this allows the reader to understand and empathize. However, both media outlets tend to represent climate refugees as «third world others»: as sinking strangers.

**Keywords:** media, climate change, refugee, postcolonial, North / South divide, historical responsibility, critical discourse analysis, framing theory.

# Index

<b>1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2. Theoretical framework.....</b>	<b>2</b>
2.1 Media, discourse and power.....	2
2.2 Climate change and global inequality.....	3
2.3 Refugees and the process of othering.....	6
2.4 The climate refugee concept.....	8
2.5 Literature review: Climate refugees in the media.....	9
<b>3. Methodology.....</b>	<b>12</b>
3.1 Research questions and purpose.....	12
3.2 Defining the sample.....	12
3.3 Collecting the sample.....	14
3.4 Analytical approach.....	14
3.5 Framing theory.....	15
3.6 Critical discourse analysis.....	16
3.7 Data analysis procedures.....	18
<b>4. Results</b>	
<b>4.1 Quantitative findings.....</b>	<b>18</b>
4.1.1 The geo-social viewpoint.....	19
4.1.2 Who gets to talk.....	20
4.1.3 The journalists: Specialized or all-rounders?.....	20
4.1.4 Visual indications.....	21
4.1.5 Numbers count.....	22
<b>4.2 Discursive analysis.....</b>	<b>22</b>
4.2.1 Framing the climate refugee.....	23
4.2.2 Increasing, yet uncertain numbers.....	24
4.2.3 Sinking strangers – photographic depictions.....	25
4.2.4 Post-colonial patterns: Climate refugees and agencies.....	26
4.2.5 Sink or swim: Deterministic representations.....	28
4.2.6 Historical responsibility: The conflict that faded.....	29
4.2.7 Us vs. climate refugees.....	30
<b>5. Discussion.....</b>	<b>32</b>
5.1 Future research opportunities.....	35
<b>6. References.....</b>	<b>36</b>
Appendix 1: visual content.....	40
Appendix 2: codebook.....	44
Appendix 3: coding sheets.....	45

## 1. Introduction

«Goodbye from the world's biggest polluter». This was the phrase the American leader George W. Bush decided to use when he left the Group of Eight's discussions on new targets to cut greenhouse gas emissions in 2008. Even though he was wrong – China was the world's biggest polluter then and continues to be so today – the message was clear: The United States will not take responsibility for the planet's rising temperatures. Donald Trump made the same statement when he withdrew from the Paris climate agreement on the 1<sup>st</sup> of June this year.

The consequences of climate change are global, though they hit people differently. In many countries throughout the global South people are forced to leave their homes, becoming *climate refugees*. Global warming could cause a bigger refugee crisis than the one we see today, but those that have to flee because of climate change do not have a judicial or political status as refugees, and cannot be granted asylum. The numbers of climate refugees will increase in the future. Even though exact numbers are hard to predict, it is an issue we will have to address both in media practice and political governance. There is no doubt about the urgency and severeness of this issue, however the media coverage of climate refugee is scarce, arbitrary and prejudiced. Farbotko criticizes the media and NGOs for problematically using climate refugees to speak for an entire planet, blaming journalists and activists for *wishful sinking*: «Only after they disappear will the islands become an absolute truth of the urgency of climate change, and thus act as a prompt towards saving the rest of the planet» (2010: 5). Bettini claims that dystopian narratives of fleeing refugees framed within both humanitarian and national security agendas, reduce the concerned populations to the status of victims, «either to protect or to fear» (2012: 70). It is important to have an accurate and respectful coverage of climate refugees, because inadequate information on the issue would render the global community less capable of dealing with it.

Two of our greatest global challenges intersect within the climate refugee: climate change and forced migration. The mass media's treatment of these issues has a crucial impact on global policy. Therefore, this study seeks to investigate how climate refugees are being represented in two transnational media outlets: The BBC and Al Jazeera, as representatives of the global North and the global South. The research considers the portrayal of *historical responsibility*: The notion that industrialized countries should take on greater responsibilities for the climate crisis due to their past (and present) emissions. Drawing on post-colonial studies, framing theory and critical discourse analysis, the research will review frames and discourses on climate refugees

on the BBC and Al Jazeera, and connect them to questions of global power structures. This study seeks to identify in what way the international community, and with them the world's biggest polluters, says «goodbye» to the consequences of their emissions; climate refugees, through media discourse. It also aims to examine the differences between the two media outlets, and the potential impacts of their geopolitical positions. Representations of climate refugees have been reviewed to some extent, but as the phenomenon is relatively new, the existing literature is limited and situation-specific. The empirical research on the issue has not covered how climate responsibility is portrayed on a global scale. Knowing more about the representation of climate refugees could prepare us to recognize a phenomenon that will continue to grow, rapidly. A critical and socially committed study on the representations of climate refugees is thus necessary, and this study seeks to provide a contribution to this issue.

## **2. Theoretical framework**

This section will present the theories and ideas that inform the study. It aims to place the topic in a global political context, and it gives explanations of two concepts that are central to the research; the climate refugee concept and the concept of historical responsibility. Ultimately, it provides a review of existing academic literature on climate refugee representations in the media.

### **2.1 Media, discourse and power**

We make sense of the world around us through language. Language is a form of social practice, that both shapes and is shaped by society (Machin & Mayr, 2012). By communicating, people try to express particular worldviews and transmit them further, to make them appear *commonsensical* (Hodge & Kress, 1988). This process is accelerated by the media, and those that control the media are thus in powerful positions, because they form the representations of the world – the ways in which we see it. Gramsci states that mass media is the «subject to production, reproduction and transformation of hegemony» (Strinati, 1995: 168). The concept of hegemony refers to how dominant groups in society manage to persuade subordinate groups to accept their moral, political and cultural values as well as their institutions (Gramsci, 1971). By creating this consent, dominant groups in society can spread their ideology and maintain their influence. Ideology then, in the Marxian sense of the word, means the instrument that the ruling forces use to exercise power over others. From this viewpoint, mass media is capable of making «inequalities appear natural and inevitable to those who suffer the deprivation and

oppression they entail» (Strinati, 1995: 125). To study the ways in which power structures are enforced is therefore important if one wants to reveal, and ultimately, oppose them.

Media representations and their meanings are not stable nor fixed, but they rely on those who shape the language. Hall asserts that people have the power to define and redefine the meanings, since they are produced through the processes of representation – and they depend on the subjects that control the means of representation (1997: 19). Drawing from Gramsci's theory of hegemony and the ruling classes' creation of consent, Hall writes that the media are the institutions that «not only reflect and sustain the consensus» but «help produce consensus and manufacture consent, acting as an important tool to establish hegemony» (1982: 86). Media representations can then, following these lines of thought, not be separated from economic and political systems – but rather be seen as expressions of power relations. Hall's approach to representation concerns these effects and consequences:

It examines not only how language and representation produce meaning, but how the knowledge which a particular discourse produces connects with power, regulates conduct, makes up or constrains identities and subjectivities, and defines the way certain things are represented, thought about, practiced and studied (1997: 6).

This study will take a closer look at these particular discourses, and how they produce knowledge about climate refugees. By studying discourse, we can understand how language is used to exercise power and represent the social realities related to global hierarchies. Fairclough defines discourse as «a practice not just of representing the world, but of signifying the world, constituting and constructing the world in meaning» (1992: 64). Power relations are discursive, they are spread and practiced through discourse, and through a careful analysis of them, one can «reveal connections between power, language and ideology that are hidden from people» (Fairclough & Wodak, 1997: 272). Critical discourse analysis is then useful in order to understand the global power structures that form the representations of climate refugees, as well as the political system that created them in the first place.

## **2.2 Climate change and global inequality**

In December 2015, the Paris Agreement was adopted by 195 member states within the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC). Each country committed itself to cutting greenhouse gas emissions so that the global average temperature would not rise more than two degrees over pre-industrial levels, and to increase the ability to adapt to the adverse impacts of climate change (UNFCCC, 2015). These «adverse impacts» refer to droughts and

heat waves, rising sea levels, extreme weather and shifting rainfalls – continued emission of greenhouse gases would in all increase the likelihood of «severe, pervasive and irreversible» consequences for both people and ecosystems all over the world (IPCC, 2014: 8). However, the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) recognizes that these risks are «unevenly distributed» and that they are «generally greater for disadvantaged people» (IPCC, 2014: 9). This is why *climate justice* was mentioned in the preamble of the Paris Agreement as having «importance for some» (UNFCCC, 2015: 21).

The main claim of the climate justice concept is that those who have contributed the least to climate change suffer the most, and that this is unfair (Roberts & Parks, 2006). The climate justice concept stresses the importance of *historical responsibility*; the notion that rich countries are more culpable for our current ecological crisis than poor countries because of their emissions, and should therefore take on greater responsibility. Chomsky asserts that this responsibility lies in the tendency to dismiss the interests of poor people as well as future generations, because they are considered to have no interests at all by the global market economy, and «those who accept this institutional assemblage will work to destroy the possibility of decent survival for our grandchildren, if by so doing (they) can maximize their own wealth» (Chomsky as cited in Sethness-Castro, 2012: 78). Our current, global situation has long historical roots, and this is also visible within the international climate change negotiations, and their emphasis on not heating the earth with more than two degrees over pre-industrial levels. By pre-industrial levels, the Paris Agreement refers to the years between 1850 and 1900, when the industrial revolutions in Europe, the United States and Japan had prepared these countries to become the most prominent polluters in the world (Roberts & Parks, 2006). Their privileged positions were gained through imperialism; the colonization of territories, people and resources. These power dynamics changed throughout the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> century with the gained independence of former colonies, but they maintained their function: to secure the global economic dominance of the (former) colonizers. According to dependency theory, this historical condition shapes the world economy into favorizing wealthy *core* states at the expense of poor states on the *periphery*, as resources flow from the latter to the former, and enrich the core states (Santos, 1971). Frank describes the system as following:

Historical research demonstrates that contemporary underdevelopment is in large part the historical product of past and continuing economic and other relations between the satellite underdeveloped and the now developed metropolitan countries. Furthermore, these relations are an essential part of the capitalist system on a world scale as a whole (1971: 3).

Both former and current power structures have an impact on the earth, how human beings treat it, what consequences it has – and for whom. As Said states, as a post-colonial thinker, we must «fully comprehend the pastness of the past, there is no just way in which the past can be quarantined from the present. Past and present inform each other, each implies the other and each co-exists with the other» (1994: 7). Today, the world's industrialized countries are responsible for 60 percent of the greenhouse gas emissions that contribute to climate change, while developing countries suffer the «worst and first» effects of climate-related disasters (Roberts & Parks, 2006).

The reasons why climate change consequences hit developing countries so hard are both economic, geographic and political. As temperatures and oceans rise, the tropical and subtropical regions in are especially affected, since countries near the equator have the world's highest temperatures from before (Wang et al, 2014). This means longer and more intense rain seasons, extended droughts, as well as stronger and more frequent typhoons and hurricanes (IPCC, 2014). According to the annual Climate Change Vulnerability Index, the ten countries most vulnerable to climate change, are Chad, Bangladesh, Niger, Haiti, the Central African Republic, the Philippines, Sierra Leone, South Sudan, Nigeria, Ethiopia and Eritrea (Verisk Maplecroft, 2016). All these countries lie within the tropical region, and all of them except two (the Philippines and Nigeria) are on the United Nations' list of the world's «least developed countries» (UNCTAD, 2016). The geopolitical location thus intersects with the countries poverty level, and the economic means of the country also determines its possibilities for adaptation: A poor country that already struggles to keep its citizens safe and healthy, will have even more trouble tackling a flood, typhoon or drought. At the same time as these countries are suffering the consequences of climate change, they are also in need of economic development. A polluting development process like the one the industrialized countries went through, however, will cause even more damage on the earth in general and in many of these countries specifically – even though it can create economic growth in the short term. This presents a dilemma between development and climate change mitigation, where developing countries find themselves presented with unsatisfactory options (Howard, 2009).

In order to address the inequalities, the Green Climate Fund (GCF), instigated by the UNFCCC in 2009 and named as a key mechanism in the Paris Agreement in 2015, is supposed to gather 100 billion dollars each year and then channel the finance through «prioritizing action in Least Developed Countries (LDCs) and Small Island Developing States (SIDS)» (Mikolajczyk, 2016:



2). The GCF is however severely underfunded, as it relies on the political will of national governments. Without financial support, the challenges the developing countries that are vulnerable to climate change have to face become even more complicated: they both have to adapt to climate change *and* bring people out of poverty, preferably using renewable energy. Climate change, then, remains both a cause and consequence of global inequality. In order to explain these inequalities, this paper will use the postcolonial concepts of the *global North* and the *global South*. The global North generally refers to rich, industrialized countries, including Japan, Australia and New Zealand. The global South refers to poorer, developing countries in Africa, Latin America, Asia and the Middle East. These countries have in common «an entire history of colonialism, neo-imperialism, and differential economic and social change through which large inequalities in living standards, life expectancy, and access to resources are maintained» (Dados & Connell, 2012: 13).

### **2.3 Refugees and the process of othering**

After Hurricane Katrina hit New Orleans on the American Gulf Coast in 2005, reporters and politicians used the term «refugee» to describe the victims. Many of the people that were uprooted from their homes were poor African-Americans, and after a couple of days, black media commentators as well as the victims themselves objected to the term «refugee», calling it *racially biased* (Sommers et al., 2006). To them, the term implied that victims of Hurricane Katrina were second-class citizens, or even foreigners in their own nation (Gemenne, 2006). Reporters in New Orleans had compared the situation to a «refugee camp in a Third World country», describing how victims wore «donated clothes», that they were «sleeping on the floors of overpopulated shelters» and «carried the scraps of their lives in plastic trash bags» (Masquelier, 2006: 737). The victims of Hurricane Katrina did not want to be connected to the image of a «third world refugee», and the president of the United States also rejected the term, after receiving critique for not acting rapidly. Within a week, George W. Bush decried use of the term saying that «the people we're talking about are not refugees. They are Americans, and they need the help and love and compassion of our fellow citizens» («calling Katrina survivors», 2005). After this, many news organizations made formal announcements of a shift to terms as «evacuees», «survivors» or «victims» (Gemenne, 2006).

The rejection of the term «refugee» is a result of its whiff of *otherness*; something different and unknown one does not want to be associated with. A refugee is in many cases perceived as an *other*. How is this Other constructed and why is it dangerous? Hall argues that people in the

West construct themselves based on their differences with people from other cultures in a binary logic of self vs. other (Hall, 1991). He focuses on the negative aspect of construction when he explains the relationship between identity and the other: «Identity is a structured representation which only achieves its positive through the narrow eye of the negative. It has to go through the eye of the needle of the other before it can construct itself» (1991: 21). This identity construction can lengthen already existing distances to marginalized groups, to «third world refugees» for example, because when «we» see «them» as fundamentally different, it is easier for «us» to think less of «them». The construction can be used to normalize and even naturalize global power structures. Said tried to subvert this artificial dichotomy:

To build a conceptual framework around a notion of Us-versus-Them is, in effect, to pretend that the principal consideration is epistemological and natural — our civilization is known and accepted, theirs is different and strange — whereas, in fact, the framework separating us from them is belligerent, constructed, and situational (2001: 577).

He states that the Western identity could not exist without the other, and the western identity could maybe not be conceived as «superior» if we did not compare it to other identities. Foucault sees the process of «othering» as something heavily intertwined with power and knowledge. To him, the process is an assemblage of all the things that are done in order to construct and maintain imaginary representations, as a refugee as someone who will come in unknown numbers and destabilize «our» societies (Rieder, 2008: 76). This «knowledge of the Other» is used to serve the ruling powers geopolitically, and to defend the dominant ideology – the Western culture. This implies a hierarchy, where the division between «us» and «them» is used to keep power where it already lies (Rieder, 2008). To «other» someone is then also an act of power relations, often happening along the lines of reasons for discrimination, like class, ethnicity, gender and sexuality. It can be a tool for those who want to suppress minority voices, and give them less volume and authority – like when media representations «consigns refugees to their bodies, to a mute and faceless physical mass» (Rajaram, 2002: 2). Holliday defines *othering* as «the process whereby “the foreign” is reduced to a simplistic, easily digestible, exotic or degrading stereotype» (Holliday, 1999: 245). Refugees are often represented as an Other in the media, embodying these reductive traits. It was perhaps this image the victims of Hurricane Katrina wanted to shake off when they refused to be called «refugees». The reason why was perhaps not only the fact that they had not actually left the country, it was maybe also that they did not want to be treated on the same terms as a «third world Other».

## 2.4 The climate refugee concept

According to the United Nations, a refugee is an individual who has been forced to flee his or her country because of persecution, war, or violence – and that are unable or unwilling to return «owing to the well-founded fear of persecution for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion» (UNHCR, 2016). A *climate refugee* is thus not recognized by the Geneva Refugee Convention of 1951, and cannot be granted refugee status as an asylum seeker within the current judicial system. On these grounds, the United Nations and the foremost international body working on the issue, the state-led Platform on Disaster Displacement, does not use the term, since the «concept does not exist in international law» (Platform on Disaster Displacement, n.d.). Instead, they use the term *cross-border disaster-displaced person*, referring to an individual that «flee or are displaced across borders in the context of sudden- or slow-onset disasters, or in the context of the effects of climate change» (ibid). Environmental organizations and engaged scholars have called for the legal recognition of climate refugees, by including them in the Geneva convention. Today, this does not seem very likely, as countries in both the global North and global South are reluctant to take on more responsibility towards refugees. The Platform on Disaster Displacement's approach reflects the global unwillingness to prioritize climate refugees in an international, legal framework, as they have chosen to focus «on the integration of effective practices by States and (sub-) regional organizations into their own normative frameworks in accordance with their specific situations», «Rather than calling for a new binding international convention on cross-border disaster-displacement» (Platform on Disaster Displacement, n.d.).

Afifi and Jäger (2010) assert that when talking about climate refugees, a conceptual division into a sociological conception and a legal conception can be helpful. Following this approach, all people that are forced to migrate to survive meet the *sociological* definition of a refugee, while they may not meet the essential element of the *legal* one: the right to protection. This study is using the sociological conception of the term, in order to recognize the climate refugees' need for protection. However, the conception «climate refugee» is not uncomplicated, and it sometimes intersects with the legal one. A climate refugee is defined as someone who is forced to leave his or her original territory as a consequence of environmental changes such as rising sea levels, drought or extreme weather, like monsoons, hurricanes and tsunamis (Terminski, 2011). Climate change migration though, does not happen in a vacuum. The reason why a person is forced to migrate might be complex and multifaceted, the person could be fleeing from poverty, conflict or discrimination in addition to the consequences of climate

change. The climate change effects are «intimately bound up with issues of development, population growth, and economic and social policy choices», and this is also why it is so hard to count both the amount of climate refugees today and predict the future numbers (Afifi & Jäger, 2010: 7). This paper will not concentrate on the discussion of statistics, however, but on the multimodal language used to describe climate refugees.

## **2.5 Literature review: Climate refugees in the media**

Not a lot of empirical research on the media representations of climate refugees has been carried out, and the vast majority of the research conducted is geographically specific. Most of it stemming from Oceania, it is focused around Pacific island states such as Kiribati, Tuvalu and Vanuatu as well as Australia and New Zealand. Farbotko is perhaps the most prominent scholar in the field. She criticizes the media and NGOs for problematically using climate refugees from the Pacific islands as spokespersons for an entire planet, blaming journalists and activists for *wishful sinking*: «Only after they disappear will the islands become an absolute truth of the urgency of climate change, and thus act as a prompt towards saving the rest of the planet» (2010: 5). She identifies three different discourses about environmentally displaced people in the Pacific Ocean: Climate refugees, skilful seafarers and oceanic drifters, through a discourse analysis of newspapers in the Pacific islands, Australia and New Zealand (2012). The *climate refugees*, she writes, are seen as victims or potential threats to stability, with headlines like «What happens when your country drowns» and «first climate refugees look to relocate» (2012: 123). The *skilful seafarers* – on the other hand – presents a more autonomous and active discourse, building on ancient history. Farbotko calls this the *vaka* discourse, the word *vaka* being a metaphor for ongoing journeys in Polynesian culture, both figurative and literal. This discourse includes reports on the Polynesian Voyaging Society (PVS), that started to reenact long voyages successfully, and an association called *Tulele Peisa*, which means «sailing the waves of our own», made to organize the voluntary evacuation of people from the sinking island Carteret in Papua New Guinea (2012: 131). The *drifter discourse*, as Farbotko calls it, derived from an old Polynesian tradition where young men left their island in a small boat in order to punish their elders by not coming back – and in many cases this meant suicide (2012: 133). This was an ambivalent discourse both connected to death and survival, with an unexpected outcome, but it highlighted survival skills and the historically ongoing voyages between the islands.

Farbotko finds that the two discourses *skilful seafarers* and *drifter discourse* only had news value within Pacific audiences, while the *climate refugee* discourse dominated the media in Australia and New Zealand (2012: 129). She concludes that the *climate refugee* discourse is a means for political leverage, that Australia and New Zealand use to construct their images as regional super powers (2012: 135). The climate refugee discourse assumes that climate displacement is deemed to originate in the developing world, and that people are flooding into the industrialized world – or they need help from it. Farbotko writes:

Through the projection of their own fears of a warming world and desires to offer Western solutions to distant others, climate refugee advocates often imagine Pacific islanders and desperate and disempowered refugees. These imaginings enable Pacific migrants to be positioned as something to either fear or control by those in the industrialized world (2012: 135).

Farbotko et al. develops these discourses into narrative frames in the paper «Being(s) framed: The means and ends of framing environmental migrants» (2015). Through a qualitative, interpretative approach, they investigate the different discourses of think tanks, political leaders, national and international organizations and the media – in order to look at how these generate directions for policy action. Farbotko et al. divides the discourses into four frames, that explain the various roles the climate refugees assume within the different discourses: victims, security threats, adaptive agents and political subjects. They write:

Within the contemporary policy debate unhelpful dichotomies still linger – between the North as developed and expert and South as victims and deficient – reducing the scope and reach of communication and advocacy. We have argued that this, in part, relates to the strong cultural resonance that the victim framing perpetuates (Farbotko et al. 2015: 114).

When it comes to the media, the climate refugees have mainly two roles in the content investigated: Victims and security threats (Farbotko et al. 2015: 108). The security threat frame is potentially very destructive. Hartmann (2010) reviews how the security threat frame is strategically used by the US Department of Defense to serve their interests and increase their budget. She raises the question of how the alarmist rhetoric on climate refugees, using dramatic language with words such as «extinction» and «apocalypse», could further militarize the development assistance and distort climate policy» (Hartmann 2010: 233).

Furthermore, in line with Farbotkos concept of *wishful sinking*, Dreher and Voyer (2015) finds another role assigned to climate refugees by investigating Australian media's depictions of Kiribati: The focus on Small Island Developing States (SIDS) as «proof» of climate change. Dreher and Voyer argues that the «proof» frame, in addition to the «victim» and «refugee»

frame, «undermine the desire of SIDS communities to be seen as proactive, self-determining, and active agents of change» (2015: 26). They then explore the Pacific islanders' own view of the coverage, and participants from Kiribati propose alternative media frames such as climate justice frames, frames of human rights, active change agents, and migration with dignity (Dreher & Voyer, 2015). Bettini states in his paper «Climate Barbarians at the Gate? A critique of apocalyptic narratives on 'climate refugees'» (2013) that the dystopian tales told by the media are doing the climate refugees no good – and that maybe actually the opposite is happening. Bettini conducts a discourse analysis of documents stemming from five different actors; the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), Nicolas Stern, Christian Aid, the Environmental Justice Foundation and the People's Conference on Climate Change and the Rights of Mother Earth. He divides the actor's documents into respectively four discursive categories: a scientific category, a capitalist category, a humanitarian category and a radical category. In accordance with Farbotko's frames of victims and security threats, and Dreher and Voyers frame of proofs of climate change, Bettini claims that the climate refugees are depicted as someone to either fear or protect – in all the categories except the radical one. This in turn he argues, is taking away their possibilities to form their own political agency (2013: 68). He concludes that these narratives leave underlying power structures untouched, and that that they hinder radical climate politics. Hingly (2017) calls for the abolishment of the categorization of Pacific peoples as «climate refugees» altogether, naming it «irresponsible» and «insensitive». She claims the use of such a term «is damaging as it depicts these peoples as a vulnerable, rather than resilient group» (Hingly, 2017: 2). To Hingly, the term dismisses these peoples' potential to contribute to the fight against climate change, and she does not offer an alternative, as she rejects any label (2017: 11).

After reviewing the work of Farbotko, Dreher and Voyers, Bettini, Hartmann and Hingly, it would seem appropriate to deploy a qualitative analysis on global news organizations and their frames in order to try and bring more specific information to the table. Farbotko et al. advocate for greater reflexivity concerning presumptions and blind spots about climate refugees (Farbotko et al. 2015: 114). This study will try to cover some of them – or maybe just find some new ones.

### **3. Methodology**

In order to clarify the steps of the research process and the thoughts behind them, this section discusses the methodological and analytical approach to the topic. The following pages formulate the purpose of the study and describe how the sample was defined, collected and analyzed.

#### **3.1 Research questions and purpose**

As the literature review has shown, the research done on media depictions of climate refugees is mainly investigating representations of peoples from the Pacific islands, them being the most widely known victims of climate change. This paper, however, tries to expand the horizon and look at the issue in a more global manner, recognizing the existence of climate vulnerability in many other parts of the world. In order to emphasize the transnationality of the issue, I will analyze the discourse on climate refugees in two international media companies. The purpose of this study is to describe the main features of the representations of climate refugees on the BBC and Al Jazeera websites. Through reviewing these media outlets' coverage, I will look for differences regarding their emphasis on historical climate responsibility, taking their geopolitical positions into consideration. In that manner, this paper will investigate how driving forces of climate change, such as for example rich countries, the fossil industries and multinational corporations, are given responsibility for the creation of climate refugees – as well as the agency of the refugees themselves within the situation. I will work on the basis of three research questions:

RQ1: *How are the climate refugees represented?*

RQ2: *In what way is historical climate responsibility part of the discourse?*

RQ3: *How do the representations in the BBC and Al Jazeera differ from each other?*

#### **3.2 Defining the sample**

Altogether, 29 individual news stories constitute the sample – 14 stories from the BBC and 15 stories from Al Jazeera. This is an exhaustive sample of the online coverage, representing all stories produced by both media outlets on climate refugees throughout 17 years, from when the concept was first mentioned in year 2000 and until today. Within the sample, there are news features, opinion and news articles, radio debates, news bureau articles, photo features and TV programs. I decided include all formats since the sample already is relatively small, and I wanted to get an overview of the coverage in total.

I have chosen the BBC and Al Jazeera because both of their differences and similarities. The interconnections between them are also an interesting component, as they imply common objectives. The British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC), headquartered in London, was founded in 1923 and is thus the oldest public broadcasting organization in the world («the history of the BBC», 2007). It is also the world's biggest broadcaster in number of employees, and since the launch of BBC World Service in 2014 it broadcasts in 29 languages, as well as providing extensive TV, radio and online services in Arabic and Persian. The BBC's television and online services are today «accessible in virtually every country in the world» (Satti, 2015: 37). Al Jazeera on the other hand, is a rather young channel that was founded in 1996, shortly after the BBC's shutdown of their Arabic television channel (that was later relaunched in 2008). Al Jazeera, meaning «the island» in Arabic and headquartered in Doha, is a private media outlet funded by the ruling family in Qatar on the Arabian Peninsula (Habib, 2011). Al Jazeera is amongst the world's largest news organizations with 80 offices around the world, as well as two different TV channels in addition to the Arabic one: Al Jazeera English and Al Jazeera Balkans. Al Jazeera published its first, English-speaking website in 2003, and after Al Jazeera English' launch in 2006, it has been viewable in 130 countries (Satti, 2015).

The BBC and Al Jazeera conduct massive scale broadcasting in numerous languages, with journalistic, political and commercial interests in expanding their networks. Both offer extensive services in English and Arabic, trying to reach out to the audience of their counterpart, «keen to carve a niche in the others' market» (Barkho, 2007: 13). The two of them seek to get their message through and to gain a hegemonic position in as many countries as possible. Nonetheless, their points of departure are very different. In this study, the BBC and Al Jazeera will be treated as representatives of the global North and the global South. I acknowledge that this categorization simplifies a complex situation. The BBC, as the British public channel, is representing one of the world's greatest colonial powers and a country that continues to be highly influential, both politically, culturally and economically. However, this does not mean that BBC journalists abstain from having a critical perspective on Britain and the North's role in history – they certainly do in many cases. Al Jazeera, representing Qatar, a former British protectorate that today has the highest income per capita in the world, is no typical example of a «global South country». The organization is known for being critical towards the countries in the global North, especially western Europe and the United States, although it is very reluctant to badmouth its owners and financial patrons; the Royal House of Thani and their allies (Habib, 2011). Their criticism towards the North, notably, is deemed to be much softer in Al Jazeera



English than in Al Jazeera Arabic (Loomis, 2009). A sample gathered from the English websites of the two media outlets is thus a limited one, since it only provides the news discourses targeting an English-speaking audience.

Keeping this in mind, I would still argue that the BBC and Al Jazeera English constitute an interesting pair of global media platforms for comparison when it comes to climate refugees. As huge, international news organizations, they contribute to constructing the political agenda on global issues such as climate change and migration – towards the latter they have taken different stances. Their size and geopolitical position indicate great influence on public opinion, they both exercise soft power in different parts of the world – alongside the division of the global North and South.

### **3.3 Collecting the sample**

The content has been gathered using the search engines on the websites of the BBC and Al Jazeera. The search was performed by typing in «climate refugee», «environmental refugee», «eco-refugee» and «climate migrant», as climate refugee is not the only term in use. Since the sample has been gathered using the search engines on the websites, it has to be noted that news stories that may have been aired without being published and archived online, are not taken into account. All news stories that were available to the public when the research was conducted are collected. Stories that have climate refugees as their main focus are included in the sample, for example «where will the climate refugees go?» from Al Jazeera, which is a story that is only treating the climate refugee issue. Stories that only briefly mention climate refugees, like «would a new UN convention help refugees?» from the BBC, which talks about refugees in general, have been excluded from the sample. This is to get a more concentrated collection of data, to be able to look thoroughly at the representations of climate refugees when they are at the center of attention.

### **3.4 Analytical approach**

A qualitative approach was chosen in order to go deeper into the processes of representation. Rossmann and Marshall hold that a qualitative approach is suitable when one aims to evoke various constructed realities, or explore marginalized populations (2016: 175). As this research examines the imaginary representations that frame the climate refugees, this approach was deemed useful. An exclusively quantitative approach was discarded as being unsuitable to review the media's production of knowledge in an equally meaningful way. As Poovey writes:

«There are limits to what the rationalizing knowledge epitomized by statistics can do. No matter how precise, quantification cannot inspire action, especially in a society whose bonds are forged by sympathy, not mere calculation» (1995: 84). With this advocative appeal in mind, an attempt has been made to look at the meaning and processes the texts elicit, and therefore a method combining qualitative content analysis and critical discourse analysis has been adopted. This makes it possible to both compare the content of the BBC and Al Jazeera in a systematic way, and at the same time one could take advantage of some of the useful tools that critical discourse analysis proposes. The qualitative content analysis is, as Busch et al. (2005: 2) put it, fitted to unmask international differences in communication content. It also enables the researcher to focus on «the presence, meanings and relationships of words and concepts, then make inferences about the messages» (2005: 14). Because of the variety of form within the sample, a multimodal analysis of the content will be employed. A multimodal approach considers both text, images, video and sound, however the main focus will be on text and images, more specifically lead photos.

The approach to the analytic process is inductive, as focus and categories will develop and change throughout the review. Cloke et al. (2004: 216) explains that induction is understood as a thorough scrutiny of raw data, with the aim of finding categories, tendencies and dominating elements. Altogether these tendencies will, little by little, allow for assumptions being made from the material. The categories have been formulated step by step, extending the amount underway. As Cloke et al. (2004: 210) stresses, the analytical process starts already in the structuring of the data material – coding is analyzing – so one has to be open to unexpected information from the very beginning.

### **3.5 Framing theory**

When media practitioners tell a story, they choose from a range of different interpretations, and their choices determine the message in their texts – and how it is read. Entman (1993) describes this process as *framing*: the mechanism in which parts of a perceived reality are chosen and made significant. This is an everyday practice for journalists, guided by what Goffman (1974) called «schemata of interpretation», that allows them to locate, identify and label issues and events. The schemata is made up of an individual's political, cultural and educational background, and forms both the way a journalist writes a text and how the reader understands it. A media frame is often employed (more or less consciously) to «catch» the reader, as it corresponds with the audiences' already perceived reality. A story that does not correspond

with the dominating frame, is risking to lose its audience, as the readers can fail to understand or reject the new frame. According to Kahneman and Tversky (1986), the frames that are presented have an impact on the reader's choices, at the same time, the frames that are *not* presented can also contribute to forming the reader's way of acting. To analyze how climate refugees are framed is thus crucial if one wants to change attitudes towards them. In Entman's approach to framing theory, the process is characterized by the fulfilment of four criterias within a text's presented reality: The identification of a problem, the cause, a moral judgement and a suggested solution:

*To frame is to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation for the item described (1993: 52).*

Entman emphasizes that a content analysis informed by framing theory would «avoid treating all negative or positive terms or utterances as equally salient and influential» (1993: 57). Including framing theory in the analysis, would thus allow for a nuanced treatment of discourses around climate change.

### **3.6 Critical Discourse Analysis**

This research is guided by Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). CDA is useful to analyze how the understanding of the climate refugee is formed through processes of representation, as it views the systematic analysis of texts as potentially revelatory of ways in which discourses «colonize human subjects through often covert position calls» (Locke, 2004: 2). By investigating and identifying discourses, one can thus learn how language is used to construct climate refugee identities and represent their social realities. Fairclough defines CDA as a way to:

*Systematically explore often opaque relationships of causality and determination between (a) discursive practices, events and texts, and (b) wider social and cultural structures, relations and processes; to investigate how such practices, events and texts arise out of and are ideologically shaped by relations of power and struggles over power (1995: 132).*

In order to analyze these relationships, Fairclough argues that the interpretation of text should focus on three dimensions of discursive practice: Its manifestation in the texts, how it substantiates a political or ideological practice, and in which way the processes of production, distribution and consumption determine how texts are made, circulated and used (1995: 132).

It is important to take into account how power relations form journalistic practice, since media practitioners, although often seen as independent, are bound by hegemonic ideologies; the «institutional arrangement of the society» (Gitlin, 2003: 269). This in turn informs their decisions, and the outcomes of their decisions serve to maintain – or dispute – current power structures. As this study seeks to address global inequalities related to climate change, the investigation of how these inequalities are «expressed, signalled, constituted, legitimised and so on by language use (or in discourse)» is crucial (Wodak, 2001: 2). Because of the emphasis on the deep roots of the world's current situation, Wodak's discourse-historical approach informs the research, as it «attempts to integrate a large quantity of available knowledge about the historical sources and the background of the social and political fields in which discursive 'events' are embedded» (Wodak, 2016: 65). Taking the historical background into account, the social and political field of climate refugees will in this paper be analyzed with a special focus on *action*, drawing on the sociological stance that «representation is ultimately based on practice» (Meyer & Wodak, 2016: 140). By studying what climate refugees are depicted as doing – or not doing – one can intend to explain the established social structure that the media content projects. Who plays an important role here, and who has to tackle the consequences? In the same way, studying subjects – or the suppression of subjects – can implicate the depiction of historical climate responsibility. As Fairclough (2003) points out; what is missing from a text is just as important as what is in one.

Van Leeuwen's (1996) social actors approach is fitted to study the representation of vulnerable groups such as climate refugees; whether they are individualized or collectivized, made specific or generic, nominalized or functionalized, and so on. The study of depicted activities and their outcomes; as for example material, behavioral, or mental verb processes, is useful if one wants to go deeper into the representation of social action and what consequences it has for the depicted individual. Using Van Leeuwen's linguistic tools, one could review to what extent the climate change crisis is *deagentialized*, not brought about by human action, but «represented as brought about in other ways, impervious to human agency – through natural forces, unconscious processes, and so on» (Van Leeuwen, 2008: 66).

Van Leeuwen stresses the importance of scrutinizing not only words but also images, as well as typography, layout and color, employing a multimodal approach: «If images seem to show just «what is», we need to show that they may not always be quite so. If images seem to just allude to things and never «say them explicitly», we need to make these allusions explicit»

(2008: 137). Multimodal CDA also facilitates the investigation of the relation between the reader and the sources in the news stories, as well as the depiction of people in the images. The emphasis on words and images allows for a thorough investigation of the potential division between Us and Them. «We» in a text can be revealing in its vagueness and ambiguity, as Fairclough (2000: 153) points out, because who does it refer to? The review of the depicted distance between climate refugees and the readers will be central to this study.

### **3.7 Data analysis procedures**

The analytic process was started by reviewing some of the documents and drafting a codebook. When the first draft of the codebook was done, it was tested by collecting the data from a portion of the analysis units. Then some categories were suppressed and others added. Questions derived from the research questions were posed to the texts: Who are the acting subjects? Is there an identified cause, and who is depicted as having responsibility? Are the climate refugees represented as actors? In what way are they classified? During this process, the codebook was reviewed, changed and adapted. In the end, all analysis units were coded according to the following categories: Media organization, headline, introduction, date, author and position, section, format, length, sources and lead photo (see coding sheets in appendix 3). The material was divided into different thematic groups: Prediction, definition, consequences on the ground, management, security, advocacy, conflict and responsibility (see codebook overview in appendix 2). This was done in order to roughly structure the material, to get an overview and make it easier to handle, but also to allow for an impression of potential tendencies. Four different frames were also identified alongside with prevalent discourses. To help identify findings, notes were taken in the coding sheets and short summaries about the key differences between the media organizations were written. In that way, by using a systematic approach but staying open to the development of categories, it was possible to critically analyze the representation of climate refugees and climate responsibility in the two media organizations.

## **4. Results**

This section will present the results obtained from the sample, in two parts. First, the quantitative findings will be described, providing an overview over the content and serving as an introduction to the general coverage of climate refugees on the BBC and Al Jazeera. Then, a discursive analysis will be performed, discussing the findings in a more in-depth manner. In order to handle the references aptly, the news stories will be referred to with their media outlet

code – B for the BBC and A for Al Jazeera – as well as their number from the codebook data tables (available in appendix 2).

#### 4.1.1 Quantitative findings

In all, 29 news stories that have climate refugees as their main topic have been found – 14 from the BBC and 15 from Al Jazeera. The timeframe spans over 17 years; the first news story is from January 2000, and the last one from February 2017. These news stories constitute an exhaustive sample of the online coverage available today.

#### 4.1.2 The geo-social viewpoint

Out of the 14 news stories from the BBC, three are feature articles from «on the ground»; places where people are or may be forced to move because of climate change. The sites are the American island of Kivalina, the American city of New Orleans and the Pacific Island state Kiribati (B6, B8 and B12). These three news features are the only ones in the sample where the journalist is reporting from the field. The rest of the stories are made from the desk or radio studio in Britain, except from one news article from Dhaka (B5) that is written by a desk journalist at BBC Bangladesh. The vast majority of the BBC’s coverage is thus produced in the global North, providing only two out of 14 stories that are produced elsewhere. One article (B11) is provided by the news agency AFP.

Al Jazeera on the contrary, presents an extensive coverage provided by journalists reporting from the global South. Stories from the field comprise the main part of the sample: Nine out of Al Jazeera’s 15 stories are news features from the countries Somalia, Bangladesh, Chad, India, Madagascar and Tuvalu. The remaining six stories are either news bureau articles from Reuters and AP (two), or articles written by journalists and academics in Britain or the United States (four).

**Table 1.**

Origen of news production:	BBC n = 14	Al Jazeera n = 15
The ground	3	9
Countries in the global South	2	9
News agencies	1	2

Al Jazeera’s coverage is much broader geographically, it is reaching different areas that are affected by climate change in varying ways: Drought, flood, extreme weather and rising sea levels. The news features are *all* made in countries outside the global North. It seems like the geographical range has an impact on the sources quoted in both media outlets.

**4.1.3 Who gets to talk**

As regards the BBC’s coverage, only 5 out of 29 quoted sources are climate refugees – 17 percent of the sources in total (see table 2). The clear majority of the sources quoted by the BBC are in elite positions, such as the chief economist of the World Bank (B7), the UN Secretary General (B5), environment ministers in the UK and Bangladesh (B1) and Oxford University professors (B9). Curiously, a news article (B11) about a climate refugee from a Pacific island state, does not quote the refugee himself, even though he is named and depicted as the center of the story. Only his lawyer and judge from New Zealand are quoted. Overall, the clear majority of the sources are based within the global North. There are only five exceptions, in four articles: Two Bangladeshi environment ministers (B1 and B3), the Director-General of Vanuatu (B14), the president of Kiribati and a climate refugee from Kiribati (B12).

**Table 2.**

Sources:	BBC n = 29	Al Jazeera n = 39
Climate refugees	17 %	41 %
Individuals in elite positions	89 %	53 %

In Al Jazeera’s coverage, 16 climate refugees are quoted out of 39 sources altogether. Hence, climate refugees make up 41 percent of the sources in total – a little less than half. The remaining 59 percent are as with the BBC mainly speaking from elite positions, like the foreign minister of New Zealand (B5), the Tuvaluan secretary of foreign affairs, and the UN refugee agency representative (A11). However, the coverage presents more local sources, people that are working directly with the issue on the ground, like NGO representatives in Somalia (A10) and Bangladesh (A8), and a water specialist in India (A3). In total, 23 of Al Jazeera’s 39 sources are based in countries in the global South.

#### 4.1.4 The journalists: Specialized or all-rounders?

As for the BBC's coverage, the majority of the articles are written by journalists specialized in transnational affairs. Typically, the content is authored by an environment correspondent (B2), an economy analyst (B4), a rural affairs correspondent (B6) or a science correspondent (B7). At Al Jazeera, the stories are mainly written by all-round journalists, that seem to focus more on a geographic region (as for example India or East Africa), than a specific topic, many of them being freelancers.

When it comes to the section where the articles are filed, the BBC content is mainly categorized under *science*, *science and environment* or *Asia*. Almost all the content on Al Jazeera however, is categorized under the section *environment* until the year 2015. Interestingly though, from 2015 and until today, the content is categorized under *climate change*, *Africa*, or – the most frequent one – *humanitarian crises*. This categorization defines the coverage in a way: It implies that the BBC, in general, is treating climate refugees as a scientific issue, while Al Jazeera is treating it as a humanitarian subject.

#### 4.1.5 Visual indications

In both the BBC and Al Jazeera's coverage, the greater number of head photos depict climate refugees without names, places and context (see table 3). In eight of the BBC's news stories, the head photo depicts a climate refugee – although one could not be sure if the individual or individuals in the picture really *are* climate refugees. This is because they are not named in the photo caption or mentioned in the story, except from in one case from Kiribati, where the climate refugee on the photo is quoted in the article (B12). Of the eight photos where «climate refugees» are portrayed, only two informs the reader about the place where the photo is taken. The first one is the already mentioned photo from Kiribati (B12), the second one is a photo showing an unnamed man in Bangkok, Thailand – illustrating a story about a climate summit in Dhaka, Bangladesh (B5).

**Table 3.**

Identification of climate refugees:	BBC n = 8	Al Jazeera n = 7
Anonymous	7	5
Identified	1	2



Except from the photo from Kiribati, the rest of the pictures look like stock photos, and no information is given in order to put them into context. The situation is similar in Al Jazeera's visual coverage: Seven pictures show «climate refugees», but only two of them are named (A2 and A8). The five other individuals are anonymous, but the place where the photo is taken is mentioned in two of the cases (A10 and A13).

#### **4.1.6 Numbers count**

Overall, the coverage of climate refugees is small and limited in the two media outlets. That there are only 29 online articles in total about this phenomenon over 17 years, is curious in itself, especially when considering that the BBC and Al Jazeera are two of the world's biggest broadcasters with an outspoken interest in covering climate change issues. However, it is remarkable that the amount of news articles is close to the same in the two organizations: 14 in the BBC and 15 Al Jazeera. Due to their extended (and widely proclaimed) presence in the global South, Al Jazeera should perhaps provide more articles about such a pressing issue as climate refugees. The small number of articles underscores the perceived fact that the concept «climate refugee» is a widely under-reported subject. Moreover, it does not seem like the issue gets a lot more attention when pivotal climate change conferences are one the agenda, like the UN Conference of the Parties (COP) in Copenhagen in 2009 or the COP in Paris in 2015. This is noteworthy, as the general climate change press coverage reaches its peak around these events. The exclusion from the journalistic ups and downs of the general climate change coverage, shows how little attention the issue of climate refugees is being given. The BBC published more stories in the years 2011 (three articles) and 2013 (four articles), the years when the climate summits were held in Durban, South Africa and Warsaw, Poland, and were not as politically important as Copenhagen in Denmark and Paris in France. Al Jazeera's coverage has been more consistent, with two articles almost every year since 2005. The coverage of both media outlets seems unstructured and arbitrary, centered around NGO reports, juridical debates and some UN summits.

## **4.2. Discursive analysis**

In the upcoming pages, frames and discourses identified throughout the sample will be discussed. The representation of climate refugees and their agency will be further explored, and connected to the concept of historical responsibility.

### 4.2.1 Framing the climate refugee

Throughout the sample, climate refugees were found to be framed in four different ways, revealing different discourses (see table 4). The most widespread framing of climate refugees in both the BBC and Al Jazeera, is as a *victim* (identified 16 times, 6 on the BBC and 10 on Al Jazeera). The victim frame highlights climate refugees as people that are suffering the consequences of climate change, and that should be taken into account by the international society. The frame elicits a humanitarian discourse influenced by climate justice, and calls upon countries of the global North to act and help climate refugees. Here, expressions such as «forced to flee», «huge loss» and «potential humanitarian disaster» are used to describe the climate refugee’s situation, and the visual content often depicts climate refugees as suffering people surrounded by degraded or destructed environments (B2, A5 or B5).

**Table 4. Climate refugee frames**

	<b>Problem</b>	<b>Cause</b>	<b>Moral judgement</b>	<b>Solution</b>
<b>Victim</b> Humanitarian discourse w. climate justice	People are suffering or forced to flee their homes	Greenhouse gas emissions from rich countries	Rich countries should help climate refugees	Donate money to developing countries
<b>Security threat</b> Geopolitical discourse	Climate refugees come to countries in the global North	Climate change	No particular moral judgement	Climate refugees should adapt, with help from rich countries
<b>Activist</b> Radical discourse	Rich countries are not taking responsibility for climate refugees	Rich countries do not care about climate refugees	Rich countries exploit poorer countries	Open borders to climate refugees
<b>Abstraction</b> Scientific discourse	Climate refugees are hard to define	Future impacts of climate change are unpredictable	Call for scientific accuracy	Cancel «climate refugee crisis» / more accuracy

The three other frames; *security threat*, *activist* and *abstraction*, are equally salient throughout the sample (appearing six times each). When the climate refugee is framed as a *security threat*, the potential danger for countries in the global North is emphasized, and words such as

«warning», «unstabilize», «likely to trap» and «cause of conflict» are used. Here, the lead photos show poor people in great numbers, threatening to destabilize the world (B1, B7 and A7). This shows a geopolitical discourse, where the security of countries in the global North is rendered most important, and the climate refugee's potential impact on national borders is seen as dangerous. When climate refugees are framed as *activist*, they are «outraged» «challenging the situation» and «facing the direct consequences». Here, the climate refugees' faces are shown, confronting the reader directly (B12 and A2). This shows a radical discourse, where climate refugees are trying to gain recognition in the legal system, arguing that rich countries should open their borders because of their historical responsibility. Lastly, the *abstraction* frame portrays the climate refugee as a vague phenomenon, something that is to be discussed, displaying a scientific discourse. The visual content tends to show climate refugees in a distanced way (B9 and B10), or not show them at all (A11). Here, the numbers, definitions and predictions are the main focus, and the stories both encourage more research on field, as well as some dismiss the gravity of the challenge: «Climate migration fears 'misplaced'» (B10) and «How many climate refugees will there be?» (B9).

#### **4.2.2 Increasing, yet uncertain numbers**

One of the most prominent features of climate refugee coverage on the BBC and Al Jazeera, is their alleged numerousness. They are repeatedly referred to in numbers: «approximately 20 million people will become ecological refugees» (B1), «deteriorating environment could drive about 50 million people from their homes by 2010» (A1), «the UN is predicting 50 million environmental refugees by 2030» (A5), or «there are potentially hundreds of millions of people» (B12). First, one has to consider numerousness in itself. Climate refugees are, in the same ways as climate change, an abstract concept for many readers. Therefore, it is understandable that journalists want to provide a concrete estimate – a number – in order to explain the gravity of this future challenge. This in itself should not be a problem. However, it becomes problematic when the coverage as a whole lacks the voices of climate refugees – they are seldomly quoted – especially in the BBC stories. Thus, climate refugees are *aggregated* in the media discourse, they are turned into statistics, and by that deprived of their human features as individuals. This in turn, makes it harder for the reader to connect with them and understand their situation. Also, the numbers they will constitute in the future vary greatly in the material, it spans from 20 millions to 300 millions. These arbitrary statistics are the core theme of many articles such as «Surge in eco-refugees predicted» (A1), «How many climate refugees will there be?» (B9) and «Fears of climate refugees “misplaced”» (B10). The discussion tend to take the

focus away from the people behind the numbers, and could be deemed somewhat unuseful since it is merely impossible to predict exactly how many climate refugees there will be in the future. The Oxford university researcher Norman Myers was for example accused of exaggerating the numbers in a BBC article (B10). He answered that «It's really difficult to say how many there are and where are they... but in the long run I do believe very strongly that it will be better for us to find that we have been roughly right than precisely wrong» (B10). Considering the scientists quoted in all the news stories on both the BBC and Al Jazeera (except from one «climate sceptic» interviewed in A15), one could draw the conclusion that no one knows how many climate refugees there will be, but everyone knows there will be many. Lending a lot of attention to the statistics instead of the individuals that constitute them, is maybe then not the most constructive modus operandi to be adopted.

#### **4.2.3 Sinking strangers – photographic depictions**

The aggregation mechanism is further enforced by the visual content of the news stories in both the BBC's and Al Jazeera's coverage. Many of the photos are long shots, indicating social distance (see images in appendix 1, A1, B5 or A8), and the people are in some cases photographed from behind (B9 and A9). In most of the pictures where the portrayed people's glance is close enough to see, they do not look at the viewer, they are depicted as looking down or another way (B6, A6 or B10). A returning image in both the BBC's and Al Jazeera's coverage shows a nameless person or nameless people, walking or swimming in water. This is maybe because the journalists want to connect with the relatively common knowledge that climate change equals that rising sea levels. In these pictures, the unnamed individuals have water up to their thighs (B10), waist (A6) and neck (B3). Here one can see people in precarious and rather extreme situations, although who and where they are is unknown. The woman in the first picture, with a determined, but suffering, look on her face, is carrying her child and has a bag on her head – she is clearly moving from one place to another. But to where, from where? The two boys in the second picture are also carrying things, they are swimming it seems, and the boy in the foreground has an ambiguous facial expression, it could look like he does not want to be photographed. However, we do not know if he and the other boy are crossing a river because it is faster or if they are really escaping their homes with their belongings. The last picture is a rather strange one to look at without knowing the circumstances: A smoking man with water up to his waist is clinching his fist towards a bunch of small plants... All these pictures need further explanation, but none is provided. The photos are credited to the news bureau AP and the photo agency EPA, and one could almost imagine the journalist searching

for «sinking people» in the photo database of the BBC or Al Jazeera. The people depicted are *de-territorialized* in the images; they are taken out of their specific, geographic context and made into rootless icons of a global – but distant – problem: Poor people fleeing. The captions of the photos only refer to how there will be more people like these in the future: their numbers are «expected to increase» (B3), though they will find it «impossible to move» (B10) and the extreme weather they are suffering from will «go into the mix to further destabilize the world» (A6). The pictures are supposed to illustrate, they do not provide valuable information by themselves. Even though we cannot be certain, all the photos depicting climate refugees look like they have been taken in the global South. Victims of Hurricane Katrina in the United States, for example, are not used to illustrate climate refugees, implying that this is an issue exclusive to poor countries.

The people in these illustrating pictures are completely anonymous, they are portrayed as symbols rather than individuals. This does not encourage the readers' involvement – but detachment, as they are not able to communicate with them through the pictures. In all, the photographic angles, the low interaction level and lack of information makes them generic climate refugees, not specific people. The inattentive use of photographic evidence portrays them as *sinking strangers*, a collectivized group with few other functions than showing the consequences of human-made climate change.

#### **4.2.4 Post-colonial patterns: Climate refugees and agencies**

The overall tendency identified throughout the sample is that climate refugees are represented as more passive in the articles where they are not quoted, than in the articles where they are quoted. When the journalist is writing *about* them instead of *meeting* them and *talking* to them, this seems to have an effect on the climate refugees' depicted agency. One example is BBC's news article «Climate change migration warning issued through report» (B7):

«The government's chief scientist, Professor Sir John Beddington, who commissioned the study, said that environmental change would hit the world's poorest the hardest and that millions of them would inadvertently migrate toward, rather than away from, areas that are most vulnerable. "[These people] will be trapped in dangerous conditions and unable to be moved to safety," he said.»

Here, «these people», the climate refugees, are depicted as inactive victims of climate change, as unable to move themselves. They are not the subjects, but the objects of the situation. They have to «be moved» by someone else, maybe an international NGO or a UN agency, but they

can not themselves take charge of the situation. This implicates a post-colonial discourse, where actors from the global North are the only ones capable of dealing with complex challenges as climate change. Another example of this is the BBC news article «Website maps Vanuatu climate change flooding risk» (B14). This article is based on a radio program by Radio New Zealand about a new tool developed by an Australian research organization and a geographic information company. The introduction goes as following: «A new web tool is allowing Pacific Islanders on Vanuatu to see how rising sea levels could affect their homes and businesses over the coming years» (B14). The website is thus *allowing* the islanders to keep track of their sinking islands, it is a tool developed by the regional superpower, Australia, and *given* to the citizens of the pacific islands, indicating their dependence on Australian technology in order to survive climate change. Although a Vanuatu representative is briefly and indirectly quoted saying that the website «will build awareness regarding the challenges that Vanuatu faces» (B14), the testimony of the tools' helpfulness is given by the Australian information company – not the islanders. A company representative recounts the experience of a village chief:

«The website is already paying off, according to Nathan Eaton of NGIS. He told Radio New Zealand that one village chief was already planning to act after having access to the maps in the wake of 2015's Hurricane Pam. "He could actually move his village up the hill so it wasn't in the low lying area which is currently looking to be inundated significantly by the year 2100," Mr Eaton said.» (B14)

First, one could note that the expression «paying off» sounds rather hollow in this context, like the survival of an entire village is something that can be translated into economic terms. The use of this expression tells us something about the journalists' incapability of understanding and emphasizing with the islanders' situation. This incapability is further reflected in the text, as it does not in any manner explain the gravity of the situation the islanders find themselves in. The company representative says that the village chief «could actually move his village up the hill». Here, the climate refugees are impersonalized through objectivation, they are not referred to as acting people, but as the village they belong to – that can *be moved* by the chief alone. Moreover, the company representative says that the village chief was planning to act *after having access* to the maps on the website. This implies that the village chief had no intention to do something about the situation before he was given a technological tool by Australian actors. This shows how the power relation between Vanuatu and Australia forms the Pacific islanders' depicted handling of the situation.

Another BBC article shows the contrary. In «the man who would be the first climate refugee», the journalist meets Ioane Teitiota, a self-proclaimed climate refugee in Kiribati (B12). Teitiota has a clear goal to be recognized as a climate refugee by the state of New Zealand, and is throughout the feature article, which is relatively long consisting of 987 words and a short video, portrayed as a fighting individual with hopes and sorrows. He is depicted as engaging in both material and mental processes; Pumping up ground water, taking care of his three kids, looking at the future and dreading it:

«I'm the same as people who are fleeing war. Those who are afraid of dying, it's the same as me," he says. Like many in Kiribati, he's worried the ocean will swallow the entire country like some latter day Atlantis.» (B12)

The emphasis on Teitiota as a whole human being gives the reader a chance to get to know him and his situation. The same happens in the Al Jazeera video «Rising waters swamp Bangladesh island» (A8), where families that have been forced to move from the shrinking Bhola island are shown as how they are coping with their everyday life in a new place, talking about how the sea level rises have affected them, and how they want to change the situation. A Bangladeshi activist from the Coastal Association for Social Transformation (COAST), is quoted as saying that «the flight of these Bhola island people, is the responsibility of the developed countries, the highest carbon emitters» (A8), thus analyzing the site-specific situation with an international perspective, taking control of the portrayal of it. In similar stories throughout the sample, where climate refugees are given time to speak in their own environments, the readers are more often given a chance to understand and identify with the climate refugees' situation. Where climate refugees are talked to, met and interviewed, they seem to be reported on in a more profound way – as active human beings.

#### **4.2.5 Sink or swim: Deterministic representations**

Throughout the sample, consequences of climate change sometimes seem to be *deagentalized*; outcomes of actions committed by natural forces and not by human beings. This happens when the root causes of global warming; greenhouse gas emissions emitted by people, are suppressed: «Rising sea levels have submerged several islands and created thousands of refugees» (A3) or «a million residents (...) face bleak future as climate refugees as level of water wipes out villages» (A8). It could also happen when climate change is represented as something inescapable, as in the news feature «The Alaskan village set to disappear under water in a decade» (B8):

«Almost no one in America has heard of the Alaskan village of Kivalina. It clings to a narrow spit of sand on the edge of the Bering Sea, far too small to feature on maps of Alaska, never mind the United States. Which is perhaps just as well, because within a decade Kivalina is likely to be under water. Gone, forever. Remembered - if at all - as the birthplace of America's first climate change refugees.» (B8)

Here, the journalist is overdramatizing the islanders' difficult situation, engaging in something that Farbotko perhaps would call *wishful sinking*, as he almost eagerly waits for the island to sink and force the islanders to seek refuge. What is problematic here, is the determinism in the portrayal of a changeable situation. Knowing, of course, that efforts to stop climate change today will most probably not save the island of Kivalina, it is still dangerous to depict the consequences we see now as unavoidable – since it can make the public think that that there is not much they can do about it. When the water in itself – not what causes it to rise – is depicted as the cause of the creation of climate refugees, one could forget the responsibility of the global North and think less about cutting greenhouse gas emissions.

#### **4.2.6 Historical responsibility: the conflict that faded**

The early climate refugee coverage from the BBC is strongly influenced by the historical climate responsibility discourse. The three first articles on the topic, from 2000, 2003 and 2006, shows a clear conflict between the polluting global North and the victims in the global South. The headlines in themselves give a clear impression about the tensions: «west warned on climate refugees» (B1), «climate victims “are refugees”» (B2) and «rich nations have “climate duty”»(B3). In the first article, the Bangladeshi environment minister is quoted as calling for action on the behalf of climate refugees: «the rich world would have to find room for them» (B1). A report writer from the British New Economics Foundation says that «People in poor, vulnerable countries pay with their homes for our lifestyles» in the second one (B2). After these first articles however, the climate responsibility discourse is not so evident. After 2011, the coverage is more concerned with climate refugees as a security threat and with the statistical predictions of the amount of climate refugees, as in this BBC article from 2013:

«(...) millions of people around the world could be forced to leave their homes over the next few decades and move to countries less affected by environmental problems. "If we get climate change wrong there is a very real danger we shall see levels of mass migration as yet unparalleled," he said.» (B9)



The historical responsibility is not completely gone after this, however it is not so much emphasized. In the article «UN chief Ban Ki-moon makes climate plea at Dhaka summit» (B5), the Bangladeshi Prime Minister Sheikh Hasina is quoted as saying:

Climate change has been seriously affecting us. We are bearing the brunt of the damage though we made negligible or no contribution to the menace. This constitutes a serious injustice and must be acknowledged by the global community.

However, this is the last quote in the article, and it is not stressed as in the earlier ones.

In Al Jazeera's stories, there is no clear North / South conflict in their early coverage, however, this tension is more visible in their more recent articles. Al Jazeera's close attention to the situation on the ground, seems to bring the issue of historical climate responsibility into the foreground. In a report from Somaliland, the reporter holds that «The US and Europe are not only failing to respond to the African drought; they have probably contributed to it through their greenhouse-gas emissions» (A10). In a news feature from Tuvalu, the Pacific island nation, the journalist writes that: «The new IPCC report lays the blame for climate change squarely on human activity but many of Tuvalu's 10,000 citizens feel they bear little responsibility for the problem» (A2). And in an opinion article on climate change and its impact on democracy, it is asserted that «Climate change is a result of the Bretton Woods institutions and their deliberate policy to globalize the world economy based on extensive exports of natural resources from poor nations» (A12). When it comes to climate responsibility, it may seem that the BBC quotes sources that emphasize its importance, while the reporters with Al Jazeera seem to point this out themselves.

#### **4.2.7 Us vs. climate refugees**

A distance with regards to climate refugees is more notable in the BBC coverage than in Al Jazeera's. This is perhaps not surprising considering the different reporting techniques, however, there are other factors that contribute to this impression. Considering the thematic groups identified throughout the sample, the BBC's coverage is more concerned with defining the climate refugees, predicting their numbers and discussing the management of them, than reporting on the consequences climate change has on the ground (see codebook in appendix 2). This indicates a division between those who have the power to define, predict and manage, and those who are defined, predicted and managed – corresponding with the global hierarchical system. Al Jazeera's coverage breaks up this logic of Us. vs. them in some way, as its coverage

is more concerned with the consequences that people have to suffer in the South – not how they will be managed by the North. The main part of their coverage has «consequences on the ground» as the dominating theme. Another factor that contributes to the logic of Us vs. them throughout the sample, is the naming of the climate refugees. When the BBC refers to climate refugees, it uses prefixes such as «so called» frequently, in addition to quotation marks (B2, B4 or B7). The term «Climate refugee» is more often used in the early coverage, while «climate migrant» is more often used in recent coverage. Al Jazeera adopts the term «climate refugee» early, and does not tend to use prefixes such as «so called» or quotation marks. The term «climate migrant» is found once (A3) in Al Jazeera’s coverage, however in the terms «climate change refugee» and «environmental refugee» are also used in the same text. A term that both outlets use is «displaced» and «environmentally displaced». This is maybe the most correct term according to the legal understanding of the word «refugee», however, it undoubtedly a euphemism. To be «displaced» sounds much less traumatizing than to be forced to flee from ones’ home.

Two of the most recently published stories by the BBC and Al Jazeera show how the two media outlets depict the distance between the reader and climate refugees differently. The BBC piece is a radio debate with the headline «should we recognize climate refugees?» (B13). Al Jazeera’s piece is a TV program with the headline «how to help those displaced by climate change?» (A15). The two headlines mark the two organizations’ approach and relation to climate refugees as a whole. Throughout the sample, although with some exceptions, the BBC portrays climate refugees as an abstract phenomenon, something that might be appearing on the horizon. In this headline, a constructed «we» is referred to, possibly signifying the people that have power to decide if climate refugees should be recognized or not. This increases the distance between the reader and the climate refugee, as well as it shrinks the opportunities for understanding and action: The climate refugee is part of a «them», not really concerning «us». Al Jazeera also contributes to this logic while for example talking about climate refugees as a future security threat in three articles. At the same time, Al Jazeera’s general approach seem to be that climate refugees are already here – and that they deserve to be talked to. By taking climate refugees seriously right now, Al Jazeera makes the gap between the reader and the climate refugee smaller – while the BBC seem to make it bigger. The prevalence of the logic of Us vs. them is one of the main difference between the two media outlets.

## 5. Discussion

This modest study of climate refugee representations on the BBC and Al Jazeera has tried to identify frames and discourses that emerge when journalists in both media outlets cover the issue. The very first observation after collecting the sample, was the limited amount of articles in total. The overall coverage is surprisingly meager, considering the two organizations' massive production, and that it is an exhaustive sample of the online coverage, spanning over 17 years. As the number of articles does not go up when important, political events related to neither climate change or forced migration take place, this is an indication that climate refugees find themselves left out of the global news agenda. Why is this happening? Some of the reasons might lie in the complexities the climate refugee concept entails – they do not translate neither fast nor easily in a newsroom. First, it is the concept's relation to climate change. It is often hard for journalists to engage the reader in climate change issues, because of its «futureness», it is often seen as something abstract we will have to deal with in the future, and the climate goals that don't have to be met until year 2030, 2050 and 2100 do not make it seem a lot more pressing. Then, it is the legal definition, that the climate refugee is not recognized by the Geneva Refugee Convention, which makes the journalistic treatment more complicated, as it needs more explanation, clarification and moderation. Lastly, the climate refugee is a *refugee*, as many others that fight for the global media's attention, without getting it. The climate refugees are maybe then falling through because of their relation to already charged concepts: They are not only refugees made by climate change, they are also connected to the unknown future, which turns them into even more of an Other.

It is also then concerning that when climate refugees *do* show up in the media, they are portrayed as a concept rather than individuals. One could maybe say they are functionalized in an extreme way, not entailing any other features than *climate change* and *refuge*. This is especially evident in the photographic depictions of climate refugees, where a somewhat unconscious use of stock photos culminates in the repetitive images of *sinking strangers*; people slowly disappearing, robbed of their names, taken out of place and time. The visual depictions combined with the constantly emphasized numerousness of climate refugees, aggregates and collectivizes them until there is no individuals left for the reader to see, even less to get to know.

The extent to which climate refugees are made into generic stencils, varies within the BBC and Al Jazeera. Since the BBC's stories generally are produced far away from the past or present homes of climate refugees, and climate refugees are seldomly quoted, the representations of them remain distanced and one-dimensional. Since Al Jazeera meets them «on the ground» more often, the audience gets the chance to understand that climate refugees are people with families, jobs and hopes, and not just curious natural phenomena. This finding is an argument for more journalistic reporting in the field. Throughout the sample, feature articles that present interviews with climate refugees and descriptions of a degraded environment, offer a much more deeper understanding of the issue than desk articles mentioning a new report or a scientific debate. The proximity determines the journalistic approach in some way, and the BBC and Al Jazeera vary greatly here; the BBC mainly presents climate refugees as a *scientific issue* to be debated, while Al Jazeera generally presents climate refugees as a *humanitarian issue* that requires action. The BBC's scientific approach could maybe be connected to the occidental historical framing of climate change as an environmental issue, separated from human beings, in an artificial divide between nature and culture. This separation helps maintain the distance to climate refugees, and continues to represent climate change consequences as something that is not present, but waiting to happen. Al Jazeera's humanitarian approach takes the interactions between nature and culture into account, and shows in a more detailed manner what the outcomes are.

Even though deterministic depictions also are palpable in some of the stories from the ground, the climate refugees are overall presented as more active, whole human beings when quoted, which in turn helps the reader to identify with them. However, the *victim frame* is the dominant one throughout the sample in both media outlets. The main narrative is that the number of climate refugees will increase and that they need help. This is of course far more encouraging than if the *security threat* would be the most prevalent one, as it offers no empathy or solidarity. At the same time, the two frames are not so far away from each other. The underlying message of the victim frame is that «if we don't help them where they are, they will come here». Thus the solution of donating money to affected countries through the climate fund is often presented and urged for. This discourse represents a mechanism upholding the post-colonial status quo, where countries in the North are not held responsible for their past or present actions, but encouraged to give their preferred amount of money in order to pay for their sins. The prevalence of the *abstraction frame* in the last years' coverage, especially on the BBC, also raises an uncomfortable question. After it is established by scientists (in article B9 and B10)

that climate refugees, in fact, will not be able to seek refuge in the global North, but most likely will end up in neighboring countries in the global South, the abstraction frame takes over for the victim frame. Could this mean, then, that it is not so important to help climate refugees or to take on historical responsibility, because they will stay «down there» anyway? Is the situation not so urgent anymore? These indications in a way reveal a logic of «us vs. them», where some peoples' security seems to matter more than other peoples' security.

When the climate refugees' situation is *deagentilized*, it could maybe also be seen as a strategy to maintain the current global power structures. This is because, when climate change and global warming is deemed as something inevitable, as something almost natural, the focus goes from mitigation to adaptation. For rich, polluting countries, less pressure on mitigation; the efforts to reduce human emissions of greenhouse gases, is advantageous, as it allows them to go on as before. More focus on adaptation is favorable to the world's greatest polluters, as it pushes the responsibility over to the countries affected by climate change, as we know mostly poor countries. The last article of the BBC (B14) illustrates this shift from mitigation to adaptation, as it presents a digital tool to track sea level rise, but says nothing about how to stop the sea levels from rising.

In order to sum up: The findings of this study indicate that climate refugees are represented in a manner that uphold already existing power systems, both in the BBC and Al Jazeera. The climate refugee is framed in four ways: As a *victim*, a *security threat*, an *activist* and as an *abstraction*. Within all the four frames except the activist one, the identified discourses reveal power structures between the global North and the global South. The research finds that the BBC dedicates a lot more time to talking about climate refugees than to actually interviewing them, and this affects their depicted agency and the portrayal of historical responsibility. Al Jazeera on the other hand, takes the time to meeting climate refugees where they are, and this opens up for common understanding and action. However, considering the differences between the two media outlets, the coverage that both the BBC and Al Jazeera provide is found to be scarce and deficient. Climate refugees are generally left aside, but when they get to the front page, they are aggregated, collectivized and made generic in both media outlets. This research concludes that they are turned into *sinking strangers*; as «third world others» that do not deserve to be identified or personalized. The climate refugees are de-territorialized and their situation is deagentilized within the media content. This allows powerful, polluting people to avoid taking responsibility for their actions on a global scale. The climate refugee representations on

the BBC and Al Jazeera thus maintain the status quo. A more critical, conscious and compassionate coverage of climate refugees is necessary if one seeks to contest the current power dynamics.

### **5.1 Future research opportunities**

This small study has identified discourses and representations concerning climate refugees. To identify chauvinist and prejudiced discourse about these marginalized populations could raise awareness and contribute to well-informed decisions on different levels in society. This study, however, plays a very little part in this process. It is a limited contribution to the knowledge production on the topic, but it could perhaps still be helpful in order to identify how actors and responsibility are portrayed, as we have to know what the climate refugee discourse *is* in order to try to change it. This study has only reviewed the online coverage on the BBC and Al Jazeera, and it has been focusing on text and images. It could be useful to look also at the television coverage, to see if it constitutes more than the rather limited amount of website articles. I have investigated the BBC's English content as well as Al Jazeera English. This has given the Anglophone version of the coverage, so it could be interesting to see if it differs in for example Arabic, Bangla or Persian. Another opportunity could also be to review the coverage in additional global media outlets, as for example Telesur, Russia Today or CNN. In any case, climate refugees do not receive the international attention they deserve today, and should be recognized as a population to be taken into account, both by politicians and media practitioners.

## 6. References:

- Afifi, T., & J. Jäger (2010). *Environment, Forced Migration and Social Vulnerability*. Berlin: Springer-Verlag.
- Doyle, J. (2011). *Mediating climate change*. Farnham: Ashgate.
- Dreher, T. & M. Voyer (2015). Climate Refugees or Migrants? Contesting Media Frames on Climate Justice in the Pacific. *Environmental Communication* 9(1), 58-76.
- Barkho, L. (2007). Unpacking the discursive and social links in BBC, CNN and Al-Jazeera's Middle East reporting. *Journal of Arab & Muslim Media Research* 1(1), 11-29.
- Busch C., De Maret P. S., Flynn T., Kellum R., Le, Meyers S., Saunders M., White R., & Palmquist M. (2005). *Content Analysis*. Colorado State University.
- Calling Katrina Survivors "refugees" stirs debate (2005, July 9). NBC News. Retrieved from: [http://www.nbcnews.com/id/9232071/ns/us\\_news-katrina\\_the\\_long\\_road\\_back/t/calling-katrina-survivors-refugees-stirs-debate/](http://www.nbcnews.com/id/9232071/ns/us_news-katrina_the_long_road_back/t/calling-katrina-survivors-refugees-stirs-debate/)
- Cloke, P., Cook, I., Crang, P., Goodwin, M., Painter, J. & Philo, C. (2004). *Practicing Human Geography*. London: Sage Publications.
- Fairclough, N. (1992): *Discourse and Social Change*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Fairclough, N. (1995): *Critical Discourse Analysis*. London: Longman.
- Fairclough, N. (2000). Discourse, Social Theory, and Social Research: The Discourse of Welfare Reform. *Journal of Sociolinguistics* 4(2), 163–195.
- Fairclough, N. & Wodak, R. (1997). Critical discourse analysis. In T.V. Dijk (Ed.), *Discourses as Social Interaction* (pp. 258-85). London: Sage Publications.
- Farbotko, C. (2010): Wishful sinking. Disappearing islands, climate refugees and cosmopolitan experimentation. *Asia Pacific Viewpoint* 51(1), 47–60.
- Farbotko, C. (2012). Skilful seafarers, oceanic drifters or climate refugees? Pacific people, news value and the climate refugee crisis. In K. Moore, B. Gross & T. Threadgold (Eds.), *Migrations and the Media* (pp. 119-142). New York: Peter Lang Publishing.
- Farbotko, C., H. Ransan-Cooper, K. McNamara, F. Thornton, & E. Chevalier (2015). Being(s) framed: The means and ends of framing environmental migrants. *Global Environmental Change* 35, 106-115.
- Frank, A. G. (1972). The Development of Underdevelopment. In J: D. Cockcroft, A. G. Frank & D. Johnson, (Eds.), *Dependence and Underdevelopment* (pp. 3-17). New York: Anchor Books.

Gemenne, F. (2006). What's in a name: Social vulnerabilities and the refugee controversy in the wake of hurricane Katrina. In Afifi, T., & J. Jäger (Eds.) *Environment, Forced Migration and Social Vulnerability* (pp. 29-40). Berlin: Springer-Verlag.

Gitlin, T. (2003). *The Whole World is Watching: Mass Media in the Making and Unmaking of the New left*. London: University of California Press.

Gramsci, A. (1971). *Selections from the Prison Notebooks*. London: Lawrence & Wishart.

Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame analysis: An essay on the organization of experience*. London: Harper and Row.

Habib, T. (2011, July 13). Al Jazeera turning into private media organization. Retrieved from: <http://gulfnews.com/news/gulf/qatar/al-jazeera-turning-into-private-media-organisation-1.837871>

Hall, S. (1991). The Local and the Global: Globalization and Ethnicity. In D. King (Ed.) *Culture, Globalization, and the World-System: Contemporary Conditions for the Representation of Identity* (pp. 19-41). Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Harris, E. (2011). *Ethics and Global Environmental Policy. Cosmopolitan Conceptions of Climate Change*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Hartmann, B. (2010). Rethinking climate refugees and climate conflict: Rhetoric, reality and the politics of policy discourse. *Journal of International Development* 22, 233–246.

Hingley, R. (2017). "Climate Refugees": An Oceanic Perspective. *Asia & the Pacific Policy Studies* 4(1), 158–165.

Hodge, R. & Kress, G. (1988). *Social Semiotics*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Holliday, Adrien (1999). Small cultures. *Applied Linguistics* 20(2), 237-264.

Howard, M. W. (2006). Environmental Justice: Sharing the Burdens of Climate Change. In B. C. Parks & J. T. Roberts (Eds.) *A Climate of Injustice. Global Inequality, North-South Politics, and Climate Policy* (pp. 127-144). Cambridge: MIT Press.

Kahneman, D. & A. Tversky. (1986). Rational Choice and the Framing of Decisions. *The Journal of Business* 59(4), 251-278.

Leeuwen, V. T. (1996). The Representation of Social Actors. In C. R. Caldas-Coulthard & M. Coulthard (Eds.) *Texts and Practices: Readings in Critical Discourse Analysis*, (pp. 32–70). London: Routledge

Leeuwen, V. T. (2008). *Discourse and Practice*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Loomis, K. D. (2009). A Comparison of Broadcast World News Web Pages: Al Jazeera English, BBC, CBS, and CNN. *Electronic News* 3(3), 143 – 160.



- Machin, D. and A. Mayr (2012). *How to do critical discourse analysis*. London: Sage Publications.
- Marshall, C., & G. B. Rossman (2016). *Designing Qualitative Research*. London: Sage Publications.
- Masquelier, F. (2006). Why Katrina's Victims Aren't Refugees: Musings on a "Dirty" Word. *American anthropologist* 108(4), 735–743.
- Meyer, M. & R. Wodak (2016). *Methods of Discourse Studies*. London: Sage Publications.
- Mikolajczyk, S. (2016). Green climate fund and the Paris Agreement. Retrieved from: [http://www.climatefocus.com/sites/default/files/GCF%20and%20Paris%20Brief%202016.new\\_.pdf](http://www.climatefocus.com/sites/default/files/GCF%20and%20Paris%20Brief%202016.new_.pdf)
- Platform on Disaster Displacement (n.d.). Key definitions. Retrieved from: <http://disasterdisplacement.org/the-platform/key-definitions/>
- Poovey, M. (1995). *Making a Social Body: British Cultural Formation, 1830-1864*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Rajaram, P. K. (2002). Humanitarianism and Representations of the Refugee. *Journal of Refugee Studies* 15(3), 247-264.
- Rieder, John (2008). *Colonialism and the Emergence of Science Fiction*. Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press.
- Roberts, T. J. & B. Parks (2006): *A Climate of Injustice. Global Inequality, North-South Politics, and Climate Policy*. Cambridge: MIT Press.
- Said, E. (1994). *Culture and imperialism*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Said, E. (2001). *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Santos, D. T. (1971). The Structure of Dependence. In K.T. Fann and D. C. Hodges, (Eds.) *Readings in U.S. Imperialism* (pp. 225-237). Boston: Porter Sargent.
- Sethness-Castro, J. (2012): *Imperiled Life. Revolution against climate catastrophe*. Edinburgh: AK Press.
- Sommers, S. R., E. P. Apfelbaum, K. N. Dukes, N. Toosi and E. J. Wang (2006): Race and Media Coverage of Hurricane Katrina: Analysis, Implications, and Future Research Questions. *Analyses of Social Issues and Public Policy* 6(1), 1-17.
- Strinati, D. (1995). *An Introduction to Theories of Popular Culture*. London: Routledge
- The History of the BBC News (2007, n.d.). Retrieved from: <http://news.bbc.co.uk/aboutbbcnews/spl/hi/history/html/default.stm>

Terminski, B. (2011). Towards Recognition and Protection of Forced Environmental Migrants in the Public International Law: Refugee or IDPs Umbrella. Retrieved from: [https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=2029796](https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2029796)

United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (2016). The least developed countries report 2016. Retrieved from: [http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/ldc2016\\_en.pdf](http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/ldc2016_en.pdf)

United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (2015). Adoption of the Paris Agreement. Retrieved from: <https://unfccc.int/resource/docs/2015/cop21/eng/109r01.pdf>

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees Website (2011). United Nations Convention and Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees. Retrieved from: <http://www.unhcr.org/3b66c2aa10.html>

Verisk Maplecroft (2016). Climate Change Vulnerability Index. Retrieved from: [http://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/Verisk\\_Maplecroft\\_Climate\\_Change\\_Vulnerability\\_Index\\_2016\\_Infographic.pdf](http://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/Verisk_Maplecroft_Climate_Change_Vulnerability_Index_2016_Infographic.pdf)

Wang, X., P. Shilong, P. Ciais, P. Friedlingstein, R. Myneni, P. Cox, M. Heimann, J. Miller, S. Peng, T. Wang, H. Yang, & A. Chen (2014). A two-fold increase of carbon cycle sensitivity to tropical temperature variations. *Nature* 506, 212–215.

Wodak, Ruth (2001) What CDA is about – a summary of its history, important concepts and its developments. In R. Wodak & M. Meyer (Eds.) *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis* (pp. 1-13). London: Sage Publications.

**Appendix 1: Visual content**



B5



B5



A8



B9



A9



“ The poorest and most vulnerable people will often find it impossible to move as they lack the necessary funds and social support to do so ”

B10



Refugees from floods and droughts are expected to increase

B3



Fights over resources, hunger and extreme weather will all go into the mix to further destabilise the world [EPA]

A6



B7

**Appendix 2: codebook**


## BBC codebook

Number	Headline	Date	Author and position	Section	Format	Length	Sources	Theme group	Frame
B1	West warned on climate refugees	24/7/00	Alex Kirby, environment correspondent	Sci/Tech Environment	News article	531 words	Bangladeshi pol., UK pol.	conflict, responsibility	Security threat / activist
B2	Climate victims 'are refugees'	1/10/03	Alex Kirby, environment correspondent	Science and Environment	News article	528 words	NGO representative	conflict, definition, responsibility	Victim
B3	Rich nations have 'climate duty'	13/9/06	Roger Harrabin, Environment analyst	Environment	News article	371 words	Economist, Bangl. Pol.	conflict, responsibility	Victim
B4	More or less: Behind the Stats podcast: Climate refugees	8/5/11	Tim Harford, economy analyst	BBC radio 4	Radio debate	11 minutes	Blogger, two Oxford professors	definition, prediction	Abstraction
B5	UN chief Ban Ki-moon makes climate plea at Dhaka summit	14/11/11	Anbarasan Ethirajan, BBC News, Dhaka	Asia	News article	361 words	UN Secretary General	responsibility	Victim
B6	Costing the earth. Can Lawyers Save The World?	no date (2013 approx)	Tom Heap, Rural Affairs correspondent	BBC radio 4	Radio feature	30 minutes	Two lawyers, res., three activist	definition	Activist
B7	Climate change migration warning issued through report	20/11/11	Pallab Gosh, Science correspondent	Science	News article	620 words	scientist, scientist	prediction, management	Victim / security threat
B8	The Alaskan village set to disappear under water in a decade	30/7/13	Stephen Sackur	HARDtalk, magazine	News feature	1404 words	Two CR, scientist, oil industry repr, pol.	responsibility, consequences.	Victim
B9	How many climate migrants will there be?	2/9/13	Hannah Barns, BBC News	Magazine	News article	1147 words	UK pol, NGO repr., two scientists	Prediction	Abstraction
B10	Climate migration fears 'misplaced'	29/9/13	Dr. Cecilia Tacoli, environment researcher	Science and Environment	Opinion article	908 words	No sources quoted	Prediction	Abstraction
B11	New Zealand denies climate change asylum bid	26/11/13	No author (AFP)	Asia	News article	251 words	Lawyer, judge	definition	Activist
B12	The man who would be the first climate change refugee	5/11/15	Tim McDonalds, BBC News Kiribati	Asia	News feature	987 words	CR, lawyer, president, law professor	definition	Activist
B13	Should we recognize climate change refugees?	21/7/15	Shaun Ley, The world tonight	BBC radio 4	Radio interview	5 minutes	UNHCR representative	definition	Abstraction
B14	Website maps Vanuatu climate change flooding risk	23/12/16	No author	News from elsewhere	News article	299 words	Vanuatu pol., business repr.	consequences on the ground	Abstraction / victim


## Al Jazeera codebook


Number	Headline	Date	Author and position	Section	Format	Length	Sources	Theme group	Frame
A1	Surge in eco-refugees predicted	11/10/05	No author (Reuters)	Archive	News article	389 words	Climate scientist, UN repr.	Prediction, definition	Victim / security threat
A2	The Pacific's climate refugees	2/2/07	No author	Environment	News feature	1068 words	Tuvalu pol., two CR	consequences on the ground	Victim
A3	Hungry tides in India's Sunderbans	14/9/09	Sujoy Dhar	Environment	News feature	767 words, 774 words, 3.45 minute video	Two CR, two scientists	consequences on the ground	Victim
A4	The 'ground zero' of climate change	7/12/09	Nicholas Haque	Environment	News feature	257 words	Local NGO repr, Bangl. Pol., CR	consequences on the ground	Victim
A5	Tuvalu struggles amid water shortages	8/10/11	No author	Environment	News feature	1023 words	Australian pol., New Zealand pol.	Prediction, management	Victim
A6	Climate change: The next challenge for national security	25/6/13	Wesley Clark, NATO supreme	Environment	Opinion article	1023 words	Climate scientist	security threat	Security threat
A7	Climate change 'complicates' global security	30/3/14	No author (AP)	Environment	News article	467 words	Two scientists, UN secretary general	security threat	Security threat
A8	Rising waters swamp Bangladesh island	31/3/14	Maher Sattar	Environment	News video	1.53 minutes	Two CR, local NGO repr.	consequences on the ground	Victim / activist
A9	The looming tides	20/9/15	Robert Winder	Middle East	Opinion article	864 words	No sources quoted	Prediction, management	Security threat
A10	Somaliand: A parched earth	1/12/15	Ashley Hamer	Climate change	News feature	1764 words	Six CR, local NGO repr, UN repr	consequences on the ground	Victim
A11	Where will the climate refugees go?	22/12/15	Amy Lieberman	Humanitarian crises	Feature news article	2068 words	Two UN repr., two NGO repr	Prediction, management	Abstraction
A12	The climate change and its impact on democracy	4/4/16	Graciela Chichilnisky, economy prof.	Humanitarian crises	Opinion article	1022 words	No sources quoted	Prediction, advocacy	Activist
A13	Madagascar: On the hunt for sharks	8/6/16	Garth Cripps	Africa	Photo feature (photo rep)	282 words	Climate refugee	consequences on the ground	Victim
A14	Displaced refugees fear more loss as Lake Chad shrinks	23/11/16	Oaidl Khelifi	Africa	Photo feature (photo rep)	324 words	Two climate refugees	consequences on the ground	Victim
A15	How to help those displaced by climate change?	11/2/17	Hazem Zika, Inside story host	Humanitarian crises	TV program	25.14 minutes	Two NGO repr., one scientist	Management, advocacy	Victim

### Appendix 3: coding sheets


Number	B1
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/613075.stm">http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/613075.stm</a>
Headline	West warned on climate refugees
Introduction	The Bangladeshi Environment Minister, Mrs Sajeeda Choudhury, has said that if climate change causes sea levels to rise in line with scientific predictions, her country will have millions of homeless people.
Lead photo	
Caption	Bangladesh: One of the most crowded countries in the world
Date	24.01.2000
Author	Alex Kirby
Position	BBC News Online environment correspondent
Section	Sci/Tech
Format	News article
Length	531 words
Sources	Bangladeshi environment minister, UK environment minister
Theme group	conflict, responsibility
Frame	Security threat, activist
Research notes	<p>Historical responsibility: «the rich world would have to find room for them».</p> <p>Numbers: «approximately 20 million people will become ecological refugees»</p>





Number	B2
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/3155796.stm">http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/3155796.stm</a>
Headline	Climate victims 'are refugees'
Introduction	People forced to flee by climate change or other disasters caused by human activities deserve recognition as refugees, a UK campaign group argues.
Lead photo	
Caption	Climate change propels refugees
Date	01.10.2003
Author	Alex Kirby
Position	BBC News Online environment correspondent
Section	Science and Environment
Format	News article
Length	528 words
Sources	NGO representative
Theme group	Conflict, definition, responsibility
Frame	Victim
Research notes	<p>Historical responsibility: «People in poor, vulnerable countries pay with their homes for our lifestyles»</p> <p>Not recognized: "environmental refugees"</p> <p>Photo depiction: Anonymous black man cooking, "somewhere in poor Africa?"</p>


Number	B3
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/5343208.stm">http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/5343208.stm</a>
Headline	Rich nations have 'climate duty'
Introduction	Rich nations must do far more to help poor countries cope with the consequences of climate change, an influential report is expected to say.
Lead photo	
Caption	Refugees from floods and droughts are expected to increase
Date	13.09.2006
Author	Roger Harrabin
Position	Environment
Section	BBC News
Format	News article
Length	371 words
Sources	World bank chief economist, Bangladeshi environment minister
Theme group	conflict, responsibility
Frame	Victim
Research notes	Photo depiction: boys bathing / drowning? Where are they going? Historical responsibility: “climate duty” Numbers: climate refugees “are «expected to increase»”


Number	B4
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/p02s01rx">http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/p02s01rx</a>
Headline	More or less: Behind the Stats podcast: Climate refugees
Introduction	More or Less looks at child poverty, climate refugees and sir Henry Cooper's greatest moment.
Lead photo	No lead photo related to content
Caption	-
Date	08.05.2011
Author	Tim Harford
Position	Economy analyst
Section	BBC radio 4
Format	Radio debate
Length	11 minutes
Sources	Blogger, two Oxford professors
Theme group	Definition, prediction
Frame	Abstraction
Research notes	Discussing statistics, the UN predictions, Norman Myers' research.  Abstraction: Little attention lended to the concrete situation of climate refugees.

Number	B5
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-15722382">http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-15722382</a>
Headline	UN chief Ban Ki-moon makes climate plea at Dhaka summit
Introduction	UN Secretary General Ban Ki-moon has urged world leaders to establish a climate fund to help those countries worst affected by climate change.
Lead photo	
Caption	There are concerns that climate change may exacerbate flooding in cities such as Bangkok
Date	14.11.2011
Author	Anbarasan Ethirajan
Position	BBC News, Dhaka
Section	Asia
Format	News article
Length	361 words
Sources	UN Secretary General
Theme group	Responsibility
Frame	Victim
Research notes	<p>Photo depiction: Anonymous, looking down, long shot.</p> <p>Historical responsibility mentioned at the end of the article:  «Climate change has been seriously affecting us. We are bearing the brunt of the damage though we made negligible or no contribution to the menace. This constitutes a serious injustice and must be acknowledged by the global community»</p>


Number	B6
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b00v72r3">http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b00v72r3</a>
Headline	Costing the earth. Can Lawyers Save The World?
Introduction	Climate change has already claimed its first victims. Displaced people from the Carteret Islands, Bangladesh, Ethiopia, Kenya and the Niger delta have already become climate refugees but from whom can they seek refuge or even compensation?
Lead photo	
Caption	No photo caption
Date	no date (2013 approximately)
Author	Tom Heap
Position	Rural Affairs correspondent
Section	BBC radio 4
Format	Radio feature
Length	30 minutes
Sources	Lawyer and hurricane Katrina victim, Kivalina resident, lawyer, neighbor activist, two NGO activists
Theme group	Responsibility, definition
Frame	Activist
Research notes	Photo depiction: who and where are they?  Historical responsibility: “so far displaced people have not been defined as refugees so they have no legal rights but countries could be expected to take a number of migrants equivalent to their contribution or compensate victims for their loss”


Number	B7
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://www.bbc.com/news/science-environment-15341651">http://www.bbc.com/news/science-environment-15341651</a>
Headline	Climate change migration warning issued through report
Introduction	Governments and aid agencies should help the world's poorest to move away from areas likely to be hit by flooding and drought, a UK report says.
Lead photo	
Caption	Water shortages are likely to trap farmers in poverty, says the report
Date	20.11.2011
Author	Pallab Gosh
Position	Science correspondent
Section	Science
Format	News article
Length	620 words
Sources	UK government chief scientist, Sussex University professor
Theme group	Prediction, management
Frame	Victim / security threat
Research notes	Threatening: «Likely to trap», «warning», «potential humanitarian disasters»


Number	B8
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-23346370">http://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-23346370</a>
Headline	The Alaskan village set to disappear under water in a decade
Introduction	Almost no one in America has heard of the Alaskan village of Kivalina. It clings to a narrow spit of sand on the edge of the Bering Sea, far too small to feature on maps of Alaska, never mind the United States.
Lead photo	
Caption	No photo caption
Date	30.07.2013
Author	Stephen Sackur
Position	No specified position
Section	HARDtalk, magazine
Format	News feature
Length	1404 words
Sources	Two climate refugees, scientist, oil industry representative, politician
Theme group	Responsibility, consequences on the ground
Frame	Victim
Research notes	Wishful sinking: «Almost no one in America has heard of the Alaskan village of Kivalina. It clings to a narrow spit of sand on the edge of the Bering Sea, far too small to feature on maps of Alaska, never mind the United States. Which is perhaps just as well, because within a decade Kivalina is likely to be under water. Gone, forever. Remembered - if at all - as the birthplace of America's first climate change refugees.»

Number	B9
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-23899195">http://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-23899195</a>
Headline	How many climate migrants will there be?
Introduction	If politicians are to be believed, migration caused by climate change will cause the world huge problems. One of the latest to repeat the warning is UK shadow immigration minister Chris Bryant, who, like many others before him, said 200 million people may be forced to flee their country. But how reliable is this figure?
Lead photo	
Caption	No photo caption
Date	02.09.2013
Author	Hannah Barns
Position	BBC News
Section	Magazine
Format	News article
Length	1147 words
Sources	Immigration minister, NGO representative, two Oxford scientists
Theme group	Prediction
Frame	Abstraction
Research notes	Statistics discussion. Why does it matter? Myers: «(...) millions of people around the world could be forced to leave their homes over the next few decades and move to countries less affected by environmental problems. "If we get climate change wrong there is a very real danger we shall see levels of mass migration as yet unparalleled," he said.»





Number	B10
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/8278515.stm">http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/8278515.stm</a>
Headline	Climate migration fears 'misplaced'
Introduction	Fears of millions of "climate refugees" crossing national borders are not supported by evidence on the ground, says Cecilia Tacoli. In this week's Green Room, she says we will fail to protect the world's most vulnerable people if misconceptions about migration continue to shape policies.
Lead photo	
Caption (quote)	The poorest and most vulnerable people will often find it impossible to move as they lack the necessary funds and social support to do so
Date	29.09.2013
Author	Dr. Cecilia Tacoli
Position	Environment researcher
Section	Science and Environment
Format	Opinion article
Length	908 words
Sources	No sources quoted
Theme group	Prediction
Frame	Abstraction
Research notes	<p>Dismissing the gravity of the climate refugees situation. Fears are misplaced because they will not come to Europe?</p> <p>”Firstly, the numbers of people likely to be moving have been exaggerated. Secondly, the notion commonly expressed in rich countries - that large numbers of poor people from across the planet will attempt to migrate there permanently - is clearly wrong.”</p>


Number	B11
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-25099817">http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-25099817</a>
Headline	New Zealand denies climate change asylum bid
Introduction	The New Zealand High Court has rejected a bid by a man from the Pacific island nation of Kiribati to stay in the country as a climate-change refugee.
Lead photo	 An aerial photograph of a Kiribati atoll. The land is a narrow strip of green and brown, surrounded by shallow turquoise water. The outer edge of the atoll is fringed by white sand beaches. The water is shallow and clear, showing the sandy bottom. The sky is blue with some white clouds. In the bottom right corner of the photo, there is a small black box with the letters 'AFP' in white.
Caption	Some of Kiribati's atolls are already disappearing under the sea
Date	26.11.2013
Author	No author (AFP)
Position	-
Section	Asia
Format	News articles
Length	251 words
Sources	Lawyer, judge
Theme group	Definition
Frame	Activist
Research notes	The main character of the story, climate refugee Ioane Teitiota, is identified but not named.


Number	B12
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-34674374">http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-34674374</a>
Headline	The man who would be the first climate change refugee
Introduction	With waves breaking at his feet, Ioane Teitiota holds his hand more than a metre above his sea wall to demonstrate how high the water gets during a king tide.
Lead photo (still image from video)	
Caption	Ioane Teitiota says his family's lives are in danger in Kiribati
Date	05.11.2015
Author	Tim McDonalds
Position	BBC News Kiribati
Section	Asia
Format	News feature
Length	987 words
Sources	Climate refugee, lawyer, president, law professor
Theme group	Definition
Frame	Activist
Research notes	Teitiota as a whole human being:  «I'm the same as people who are fleeing war. Those who are afraid of dying, it's the same as me," he says. Like many in Kiribati, he's worried the ocean will swallow the entire country like some latter day Atlantis.»

Number	B13
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b062khlz">http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b062khlz</a>
Headline	Should we recognize climate change refugees?
Introduction	No introduction
Lead photo	No image related to content
Caption	No caption
Date	21.07.2015
Author	Shaun Ley
Position	Host, the world tonight
Section	BBC radio 4
Format	Radio interview
Length	5 minutes
Sources	UNHCR representative
Theme group	Definition
Frame	Abstraction
Research notes	Should “we” recognize climate refugees as an indication of us vs. them.


Number	B14
Media organization	BBC
Source link	<a href="http://www.bbc.com/news/blogs-news-from-elsewhere-38415796">http://www.bbc.com/news/blogs-news-from-elsewhere-38415796</a>
Headline	Website maps Vanuatu climate change flooding risk
Introduction	A new web tool is allowing Pacific Islanders on Vanuatu to see how rising sea levels could affect their homes and businesses over the coming years.
Lead photo	
Caption	Cyclone Pam in 2015 forced some on Vanuatu to reconsider the effects of climate change
Date	23.12.2016
Author	No author
Position	-
Section	News from elsewhere
Format	News article
Length	299 words
Sources	Vanuatu politician, business representative
Theme group	Consequences on the ground
Frame	Abstraction / victim
Research notes	<p>Postcolonial discourse:</p> <p>«The website is already paying off, according to Nathan Eaton of NGIS. He told Radio New Zealand that one village chief was already planning to act after having access to the maps in the wake of 2015's Hurricane Pam. "He could actually move his village up the hill so it wasn't in the low lying area which is currently looking to be inundated significantly by the year 2100," Mr Eaton said.»</p>


Number	A1
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/archive/2005/10/200841012103732686.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/archive/2005/10/200841012103732686.html</a>
Headline	Surge in eco-refugees predicted
Introduction	A deteriorating environment could drive about 50 million people from their homes by 2010 and the world needs to define a new category of environmental refugee, a UN study says.
Lead photo	
Caption	Environmental refugees would need aid like political refugees
Date	11.10.2005
Author	No author (Reuters)
Position	-
Section	Archive
Format	News article
Length	389 words
Sources	Climate scientist, UN representative
Theme group	Prediction, definition
Frame	Victim / security threat
Research notes	<p>Numbers: «deteriorating environment could drive about 50 million people from their homes by 2010»</p> <p>Photo depiction: Distanced mass moving</p>


Number	A2
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/news/asia-pacific/2007/02/2008525185855390756.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/news/asia-pacific/2007/02/2008525185855390756.html</a>
Headline	The Pacific's climate refugees
Introduction	Al Jazeera meets residents of Tuvalu who may leave their homes to avoid rising seas.
Lead photo	
Caption	Rick says islanders are being “kicked out of their homes”
Date	02.02.2007
Author	No author
Position	-
Section	Environment
Format	News feature
Length	1068 words
Sources	Tuvalu secretary of foreign affairs, two Climate refugees
Theme group	Consequences on the ground
Frame	Victim
Research notes	<p>Historical responsibility:</p> <p>"We have the least to do with these problems and yet we are being forced to think about [having to] move," he says. "That's very upsetting - it makes people angry you know."</p>


Number	A3
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/focus/climatesos/2009/12/2009121454853960408.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/focus/climatesos/2009/12/2009121454853960408.html</a>
Headline	Hungry tides in India's Sundarbans
Introduction	Rising sea levels have submerged several islands and created thousands of refugees.
Lead photo	
Caption	Oceanographers say the waters are rising at a rate of 3.4 mm a year
Date	14.09.2009
Author	Sujoy Dhar
Position	No position specified
Section	Environment
Format	News feature
Length	767 words
Sources	Two climate refugees, two environmental scientists
Theme group	Consequences on the ground
Frame	Victim
Research notes	<p>Victim frame:</p> <p>"The sea took away everything. My house, my land. It is painful to live uprooted but I have no choice," says Aftauddin who now lives on Sagar Island, part of the Sundarban archipelago and 150km south of Kolkata. Aftauddin's neighbour Sibani Seth is equally morose."Life is not the same here. It was much better in Goramara. I live with the fond memories of the past now," she says.</p>





Number	A4
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/focus/climatesos/2009/10/2009101011512667509.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/focus/climatesos/2009/10/2009101011512667509.html</a>
Headline	The 'ground zero' of climate change
Introduction	Bangladesh's Bhola Island succumbs to climate change displacing thousands.
Lead photo (still image from video)	
Caption	No photo caption
Date	07.12.2009
Author	Nicholas Haque
Position	No position mentioned
Section	Environment
Format	News feature
Length	774 words, 3.45 minute video
Sources	Local NGO representative, Bangladeshi politician, Climate refugee
Theme group	Consequences on the ground
Frame	Victim
Research notes	Victim frame: Climate refugee: "I go where the river takes me, but the waters have become too dangerous for my children, it's difficult to fish, many of our people have drowned"


Number	A5
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/news/asia-pacific/2011/10/2011108103627660410.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/news/asia-pacific/2011/10/2011108103627660410.html</a>
Headline	Tuvalu struggles amid water shortages
Introduction	Australia may face an influx of "climate change refugees" from drought-stricken Tuvalu, environmentalists say.
Lead photo (still image from video)	
Caption	No photo caption
Date	08.10.2011
Author	No author
Position	-
Section	Environment
Format	News Feature
Length	257 words,
Sources	Australian politician, New Zealand foreign minister
Theme group	Prediction, management
Frame	Victim
Research notes	<p>Adaptation insted of mitigation:</p> <p>New Zealand and Australia are flying water supplies into the islands, while Richard Marles, Australia's parliamentary secretary for Pacific Island affairs, told Al Jazeera that his country also planned to send desalination plants to meet the islanders' immediate needs. "In the long term, we are trying to put water tank around the island that could be used when it is raining, but right now Tuvalu is experiencing its worst drought."</p>


Number	A6
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2013/06/2013624154929948365.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2013/06/2013624154929948365.html</a>
Headline	Climate change: The next challenge for national security
Introduction	The question isn't whether we can afford to combat climate change, but rather how can we not?
Lead photo	
Caption	
Date	25.06.2013
Author	Wesley Clark
Position	NATO supreme
Section	Environment
Format	Opinion article
Length	1023 words
Sources	Climate scientist
Theme group	Security threat
Frame	Security threat
Research notes	Security threat frame: The UN is predicting 50 million environmental refugees by 2030, as regional climate-related stresses exacerbate existing political conflicts.

Number	A7
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/news/asia-pacific/2014/03/climate-change-complicates-global-security-201433061740202587.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/news/asia-pacific/2014/03/climate-change-complicates-global-security-201433061740202587.html</a>
Headline	Climate change 'complicates' global security
Introduction	Top scientists say climate change will complicate and worsen global security problems such as wars and refugees.
Lead photo	 A photograph showing a man in a small boat on a body of water. The boat is constructed from blue plastic crates and is filled with green plants and flowers. The man is shirtless and appears to be tending to the plants. The water is dark and reflects the light.
Caption	Fights over resources hunger and extreme weather will all go into the mix to further destabilize the world
Date	30.03.2014
Author	No author (AP)
Position	-
Section	Environment
Format	News article
Length	467 words
Sources	Two climate scientists, UN secretary general
Theme group	Security threat
Frame	Security threat
Research notes	Security threat frame: Climate change will complicate and worsen existing global security problems, such as civil wars, strife between nations and refugees.


Number	A8
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/video/asia/2014/03/rising-waters-swamp-bangladesh-island-201433152321802434.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/video/asia/2014/03/rising-waters-swamp-bangladesh-island-201433152321802434.html</a>
Headline	Rising waters swamp Bangladesh island
Introduction	More than a million residents of Bhola face bleak future as climate refugees as level of water wipes out villages
Lead photo	
Caption	No photo caption
Date	31.03.2014
Author	Maher Sattar
Position	No position mentioned
Section	Environment
Format	News video report
Length	1.53 minute video
Sources	Two climate refugees, local NGO representative
Theme group	Consequences on the ground
Frame	Victim / activist
Research notes	Historical responsibility: Coastal Association for Social Transformation (COAST), is quoted as saying that «the flight of these Bhola island people, is the responsibility of the developed countries, the highest carbon emitters»


Number	A9
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2015/09/looming-tides-150929110038615.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2015/09/looming-tides-150929110038615.html</a>
Headline	The looming tides
Introduction	In the future, refugees will seek areas unaffected by human global warming.
Lead photo	
Caption	What the current flow of refugees most resembles is demographic climate change, writes Winder
Date	20.09.2015
Author	Robert Winder
Position	Author of <i>Bloody Foreigners</i>
Section	Middle East
Format	Opinion article
Length	864 words
Sources	No sources quoted
Theme group	Prediction, management
Frame	Security threat
Research notes	Functionalisation: We may, in other words, need a bigger metaphor. There is one close to hand, since what this flow of people most resembles is demographic climate change - or a human global warming.


Number	A10
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2015/11/somaliland-parched-earth-151130112224968.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2015/11/somaliland-parched-earth-151130112224968.html</a>
Headline	Somaliland: A parched earth
Introduction	Somaliland's harshest drought is decimating the herder way of life and displacing thousands.
Lead photo	 A photograph showing a woman in a brown dress standing in a dry, dusty landscape. In the foreground, several dead animals, including goats and camels, are lying on the ground. In the background, there is a makeshift shelter made of a red tarp and other materials. The scene depicts the severe impact of drought on the herding community in Somaliland.
Caption	The drought has killed off herds of cattle, sheep, goats and camel and displaced thousands within the territory
Date	01.12.2015
Author	Ashley Hamer
Position	No position mentioned
Section	Climate change
Format	News feature
Length	1764 words
Sources	Six climate refugees, local NGO representative, UN representative
Theme group	Consequences on the ground
Frame	Victim
Research notes	Historical responsibility: «The US and Europe are not only failing to respond to the African drought; they have probably contributed to it through their greenhouse-gas emissions»

Number	A11
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2015/11/climate-refugees-151125093146088.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2015/11/climate-refugees-151125093146088.html</a>
Headline	Where will the climate refugees go?
Introduction	We know that climate change will force millions from their homes, but will they even be recognised as refugees?
Lead photo	
Caption	More than 19 million people from 100 different countries were forced to flee their homes in 2014 because of natural disasters
Date	22.12.2015
Author	Amy Lieberman
Position	No position mentioned
Section	Humanitarian crises
Format	Feature news article
Length	2068 words
Sources	Two UN representatives, two NGO representatives
Theme group	Prediction, management
Frame	Abstraction
Research notes	Abstraction frame: What is clear, however, is that cementing a number is not the only hurdle facing those attempting to decipher the practical ramifications of climate change. Terms such as "climate refugee" and "environmental refugee" are still not classified as legal categorisations. And it's difficult to determine whether a person is fleeing their home because of an environmental disaster, lack of work, or the established, long-term impacts of climate issues like drought or rising sea levels.



Number	A12
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2016/04/climate-change-impact-democracy-160403093028956.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2016/04/climate-change-impact-democracy-160403093028956.html</a>
Headline	The climate change and its impact on democracy
Introduction	We need to decouple economic progress from fossil fuels if we are to survive as a species.
Lead photo	
Caption	The limits on resource use can be flexible over time with the creation of equitable and efficient global markets for the global commons, writes Chichilnisky.
Date	04.04.2016
Author	Graciela Chichilnisky
Position	Economy professor
Section	Humanitarian crises
Format	Opinion article
Length	1022 words
Sources	No sources quoted
Theme group	Prediction, advocacy
Frame	Activist
Research notes	Historical responsibility:  «Climate change is a result of the Bretton Woods institutions and their deliberate policy to globalize the world economy based on extensive exports of natural resources from poor nations»

Number	A13
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/inpictures/2016/06/madagascar-hunt-sharks-160608054336332.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/inpictures/2016/06/madagascar-hunt-sharks-160608054336332.html</a>
Headline	Madagascar: On the hunt for sharks
Introduction	As fisheries collapse due to overfishing and climate change, Madagascar fishermen migrate further out to find fish.
Lead photo	
Caption	Over the past 15 years, Vezo fishermen have been travelling longer distances to seek out productive fishing grounds.
Date	08.06.2016
Author	Garth Cripps
Position	No position mentioned
Section	Africa
Format	Photo feature
Length	282 words, 16 photos
Sources	Climate refugees
Theme group	Consequences on the ground
Frame	Victim / activist
Research notes	Adaptation:  The fishermen travel to the most remote parts of Madagascar's west coast. Often living far offshore on tiny islands in the Mozambique Channel, they eke out a living in places with no potable water or food and no access to hospitals or schools.

Number	A14
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/inpictures/2016/11/displaced-refugees-fear-loss-lake-chad-shrinks-161114113351505.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/inpictures/2016/11/displaced-refugees-fear-loss-lake-chad-shrinks-161114113351505.html</a>
Headline	Displaced refugees fear more loss as Lake Chad shrinks
Introduction	Refugees displaced by Boko Haram take on new life of fishing, but fear all will be lost as Lake Chad slowly disappears.
Lead photo	
Caption	Irregular rainfalls round Lake Chad has affected fishing patterns for both refugees and locals.
Date	23.11.2016
Author	Oalid Khelifi
Position	No position mentioned
Section	Africa
Format	Photo feature
Length	324 words, 15 photos
Sources	Two climate refugees
Theme group	consequences on the ground
Frame	Victim
Research notes	Victim frame: Desertification, deforestation, intruding vegetation, soil salinity and drought are all suffocating livelihoods and aggravating poverty, making Lake Chad a fertile ground for Boko Haram recruitment.

Number	A15
Media organization	Al Jazeera
Source link	<a href="http://www.aljazeera.com/programmes/insidestory/2017/02/displaced-climate-change-170211184502936.html">http://www.aljazeera.com/programmes/insidestory/2017/02/displaced-climate-change-170211184502936.html</a>
Headline	How to help those displaced by climate change?
Introduction	Climate change and extreme weather events are displacing people in record numbers.
Lead photo	No still image related to content
Caption	-
Date	11.02.2017
Author	Hazem Zika
Position	Inside story host
Section	Environment, humanitarian crises
Format	TV program
Length	25.14 minutes
Sources	Two NGO representatives, one "climate scientist" (climate sceptic)
Theme group	Management, advocacy
Frame	Victim
Research notes	Want to help, but invites a climate sceptic hired by the fossil fuel industry to discuss the topic?